FUNCTIONAL REVIEW OF THE MINISTRIES OF RWANDA

REVIEW OF THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND ANIMAL RESOURCES (MINAGRI)

May 2008

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ANNEXES

N° 1   -   List of people interviewed

N° 2   -   Legal and regulatory environment

N° 3   -   Brief presentation of the pay system

N° 4   -   Respect for national policies in the strategic and action plans

N° 5   -   Current organogram for MINAGRI (2008)

N° 6   -   MINAGRI's missions and functions as described by the Cadre organique

N° 7   -   Development of annual action plans

N° 8   -   Budget procedure (MINECOFIN)

N° 9   -   Information system supports

N° 10[1]   -   Human resources: Distribution of staff

N° 10[2]   -   Human resources: Average age seniority

N° 10[3]   -   Human resources: Turnover and training

N° 11   -   Working relationships - Decentralisation

N° 12   -   Time management

N° 13   -   Human resource management system diagram – Integrated HRM

N° 14   -   Action plan preparation

ACRONYMS AND ABREVIATIONS

AFSR	Support to the Seed Sector of Rwanda
EDPRS	Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy
NISR	National Institute of Statistics Rwanda
ISAR	Scientific Institute of Agricultural Research
MIFOTRA	Ministry of Public Service and Labour
MINECOFIN	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MINEDUC	Ministry of Education and Scientific Research
MINICOM	Ministry of Commerce, Industry, Investment Promotion, Tourism and Cooperatives
MININFRA	Ministry of Infrastructure
MINIRENA	Ministry of Energy, Water and Natural Resources
MINISANTE	Ministry of Health
MIS	Management Information System
OCIR Café	Rwandan Coffee Office
OCIR Thé	Rwandan Tea Office
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
PADAB	Bugesera Agricultural Development Support Project
PADBEL	Dairy Cattle Development Support Project
PAIGELAC	Integrated Installation and Interior Lakes Management Support Project
PASNV	National Agricultural Extension Support Project
PCRFP	Policy Framework for the Reform of the Public Service
PDCRE	Smallholder Cash and Export Crop Development Project
PDERB	BUGESERA Rural Economy Development Project
PSTA	Support Project for the Agricultural Transformation Strategic Plan
RADA	Rwanda Agriculture Development Authority
RARDA	Rwanda Animal Resources Development Authority
RBS	Rwandan Bureau of Standards
REMA	Rwanda Environmental Maintenance
RHODA	Rwanda Horticulture Development Authority
RIEPA	Rwandan Investment and Export Promotion Agency
RITA	Rwanda Information Technology Authority
RSSP	Project for Support to the Rural Sector
SWAP	Sector Wide Approach

SUMMARY

This document is the functional review of MINAGRI which has been carried out on the request of MIFOTRA in order to evaluate the impact of the decentralisation which took place in 2006. MINAGRI has undergone two functional reviews, in August 2005 and in September 2006, following decentralisation. As a result this exercise has focused on:

- implementation of the recommendations made in the two audits (2005/2006)

- new areas of investigation which were not covered by the previous analyses

- agreement with the managerial staff and leadership of MINAGRI on recommendations and other complementary solutions identified.

A summary of the work carried out is provided in a table using the following format:

Left column	Centre column	Right column
Areas audited during the previous functional review and during the current exercise	Current situation identified	Recommended solutions as validated in a workshop held 29th April involving the professionals from MINAGRI, agencies and projects and which have been presented to the Ministry's leadership on 14th and 23rd May 2008

Several factors are still impeding the efficiency of MINAGRI:
- continued use of old working habits despite the introduction of new technologies

- weaknesses in the system for delegating responsibility, which results in significant inefficiencies (financial and otherwise)

In order to improve the efficiency of MINAGRI services some measures can be implemented IMMEDIATELY if the leadership of the Ministry makes the decision to introduce changes which - without incurring any cost – can facilitate the functioning of units. Other measures should however:

- be negotiated with other partner ministries in order to involve them

- be presented to Cabinet if they are common to all government institutions or if they necessitate a revision of regulatory texts.

The set of measures presented here concern MINAGRI, but some are equally applicable to other ministries. As a result, the proposals for their implementation are detailed in the final consolidated report. This synthesises both the improvements identified which are common to all institutions and those which are specific to each.

Finally it should be emphasised that the recommendations for MINAGRI presented here are put forward subject to a sector functional review covering all of the districts and institutions for which the ministry is responsible. Only a review of the entire agriculture sector can validate the improvements which need to be carried out to its institutions.

Recommendations from 2005/2006	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Inter-institutional links Collaboration between MINAGRI and its partners: decentralised bodies – ministries that have an influence on the agriculture sector – private operators – donors etc…	**Collaboration between districts and other partners still needs to be improved** despite the development clusters which have been put in place since the end of 2002. The agriculture clusters bring together institutions operating in the sector at district level once every two months. The compartmentalisation of institutions is still a reality. The coordination of activities between institutions is still laborious (in particular with MINALOC, MININFRA, MINIRENA, etc...). The prevalence of the hierarchical role of MINALOC over districts, without being questioned, hinders the leadership of the reform that MINAGRI is leading. The ministry and the institutions under its supervision find it difficult to access all the information that is useful to them which is detrimental to the visibility of results obtained in the sector. The person responsible for Agriculture in the districts reports to his or her direct supervisor and contact with the agents of MINAGRI is most often only to help them carry out work in the field rather than to actually collaborate in order to achieve nationally defined objectives.	**The relationship between MINAGRI agents and agencies under its supervision :** An opening up of the relationship could happen as a result of a simple **Ministerial instruction** permitting direct contact between professionals The management meetings must serve as a tool for discussing the status of activities, reorienting activities and finding synergies. **Relationship with districts**: The ministry must review together with MINALOC the texts which exist on the different responsibilities in order to be able to remind people of the contents, either in a **shared text** or in an information campaign for districts, agencies, institutions, projects and ministry professionals so that they collaborate better together and exchange information. **Relationship with other partners:** The multi-sector clusters which exist since 2002 need to be better utilised and the role that SWAPS – the creation of which is recommended by the EDPRS for 2008 – can play needs to be better defined.
Quality of services to the population	**The service offered to the population needs to be improved** cf. Clusters mentioned above. The introduction of Umudugudu and Imihigo at district level has been done with this in mind. However, performance indicators linked to agriculture are not based on results obtained in the field (e.g. % increase in production and ratio of food self-sufficiency)	Using the agencies under its supervision, MINAGRI has to have useful information available to it in order to be able to evaluate the quality of the services provided to the population. It is the achievements and results in the field that justify the activities of MINAGRI. The creation of one stop shops is designed to develop a culture focused on 'customers' and on results.
Information System (availability of data and statistics)	MINAGRI does not yet have a system which allows it to measure the impact of its strategy and annual action plans. A Management Information System (MIS) is being developed and should be operational before the end of 2008	The new MIS should be developed taking into account the statistics already captured in the Ministry's Excel database and should allow for their further development (together with data from NISR for example). It is important so ensure applications are compatible to ensure easy and reliable transfers of data.
MINAGRI's skills in planning, development support and at a technical level	MINAGRI's skills level needs to be strengthened in terms of planning and monitoring and evaluation of results. Trainings during the past three years have essentially been on Microsoft applications, software packages currently being installed (Human Resources and Document Management) and a few technical trainings. Documents provided raise a question about the quality of these trainings and on their true impact.	The quality of training should be evaluated following the course to assess the usefulness of the skills learnt. Specialists at the Ministry and the institutions under its supervision should have the right to review the contents of technical training courses. The implementation of new ICT and communication tools should be accompanied by training, for which a budget must be planned. Finally, staff should be paired up with a more experienced member of staff to ensure the transfer of know-how and in particular project staff should be obliged to ensure they transfer their knowledge.

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Operating Framework *Mandate of MINAGRI in relation to other institutions*	This Ministry has the eminent role of achieving a formidable challenge to decrease from 87% to 50% by 2020 the population dependent on agriculture The strategic role of the Ministry is not entirely understood by the professionals at the Ministry or by those at the agencies, districts and sectors. The objective relating to agriculture is at the heart of the fight against poverty in Rwanda. This aim has to be better understood in order to feature more in the action plans at every level. **The decentralisation policy** includes the contribution of each technical ministry at the district level and defines the roles of each. The document "Efficiency of decentralised services" from November 2006 specifies the distribution of roles between MINAGRI and the districts but in reality this is not respected.	See also below: Inter-institutional relationships The mandate of MINAGRI is well defined in texts but it needs to be better publicised across the country. The texts which define its role, that of the agencies under its supervision AND that of the districts as executive branches must be enforced. An information campaign or a joint ministerial instruction (MINALOC/MINAGRI) should remind people on the respective roles so that all levels understand the scope of activities, the contribution to national objectives and the level of collaboration between each entity.
Policy and Strategic Documents	Since 2004, MINAGRI has a national agriculture policy and two strategies for the transformation of agriculture. The first text gives objectives to be pursued in the long term and the second gives the priority programmes to be developed but which are due to finish at the end of 2008. A study has been commissioned to extend them to 2012. As the basis for annual action plans, the national 2009 plan will be based on activities which have not been completed in 2008. This means there is a risk the budget for next year will be reduced which is contrary to the recommendation in the EDPRS (2008/2012) which recommends an increase of 6% per year in the agriculture budget.	A procedure is proposed to anticipate the revision of strategic plans at least two years in advance and to introduce the concept of plans which can be carried over to a new year if necessary. This approach will allow MINAGRI to have its new strategic plan available at the appropriate time without having a transition year based on finishing off incomplete actions from the previous plan.
Regulatory framework	MINAGRI has the same regulatory framework common to other institutions which is based on laws (in particular Decentralisation and Statute of the Public Service), instructions (management of finance, accounting, tenders etc…) and letters. Some texts need to be revisited in order to conform to a job-based public service AND to take into account the modernisation of working tools. The new Statute of Public Service is with the Parliament and the Procedures Manual for Public Service is with the CIC. **The current salary system** is criticised by all state institutions. For MINAGRI, the system does not allow it to compete with agencies and projects to attract the talent it requires.	The new Statute for Public Service should be broadly publicised. Its implementation will require the sensitisation of those responsible and training of Human Resource managers. Idem for the HR procedures manual which is currently with the CIC. A number of supports still need to be implemented by MIFOTRA, such as the national policy for managing state employees describing the principles to be observed with regards to motivation, career development, skills management, recruitment, training, salaries etc… As soon as these supports exist, MIFOTRA will be able to review the transitory remuneration system installed in 2006.

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Management and Leadership	Some basic activities are treated at the highest level of the Administration. This vertical structure of management devalues the authority of those in charge, reinforces compartmentalisation and does a disservice to the coordination between various actors in the sector or partners. The managerial weakness results in slow administrative processes and a loss of time and it also impedes the reactivity of services and the authority of those in charge over their subordinates. Finally, the technical authority of staff at the ministry and those in the agencies under its supervision must be reinforced so that they can work effectively at district level.	Some activities must be delegated to reduce the number of administrative tasks carried out by the higher levels of management. Delegation of responsibility should be the subject of a global study to identify the responsibilities which can be delegated. The authority of staff needs to be strengthened. They must have an effective power over their agents and, at a technical level, over those of the district. They must be trained on management techniques and in particular: time management, work organisation, meeting effectiveness, evaluation methods, team leadership etc… The management method should allow teams to be mobilised and to motivate them (by factors other than salary).
Supports and Working Methods *Tools for the development, monitoring and evaluation of strategic plans and action plans*	Despite the incontestable efforts of the Minister to modernise the units, it is still evident that old methods of working are prevalent. **The tools used by professionals are not adapted.** Developed in Word, these applications do not allow for the transfer, or real treatment of data between the strategic plan and annual action plan of the ministry and the agencies under its supervision. This results in data being re-entered wasting time and creating a potential source of errors. Given the lack of appropriate tools: - Consolidation with district action plans is difficult - Monitoring – by agencies – of their own action plans as well as those of the districts is rendered more complex. The ministry lacks a tool which presents all of the planned programmes for the year breaking them down into all of the activities into sub-activities which are themselves detailed and chronological and which gives coherence to the needs expressed and the budget and provides consistency to the action plans and fixes the control points (indicators which validate the logical implementation of the plan). MINAGRI professionals monitor and evaluate the ministry's annual plan through the running of programmes and the budget to achieve a zero balance. Nonetheless they do not have the appropriate tools to monitor and enrich the analysis of results of action plans (in particular their impact in the field in relation to the aims of the agricultural reform). A report template has just been developed and sent out to district level. Given that it is developed in Word, effective use of the	The programme approach should be maintained but the methodology and tools for developing the strategic and action plans should be revisited and standardised in order to be executed in a similar way at all levels (ministry, agencies, and districts). A common procedure needs to be put in place so that each institution has a planning tool which indicates the programmes to be implemented, their priority, the deadlines to be respected and systems for revising plans so that they can be carried over where necessary. In the interim, it would be useful for a synthesis of the new strategic plan to be **captured at least in Excel or Access**. This would facilitate its transfer into the annual action plans that MINAGRI will produce based on the strategic plan by 2012. **In the medium term, the annual MINAGRI action plan should be developed in a project management application** which could include the elements of the strategic plan and the EDPRS. It would therefore be easy to consolidate and subsequently broken down into the elements each agency needs to implement. It should also take into account the district plans. The annual action plans would therefore be far more concrete and operational and could be budgeted on a justified basis. In the meantime, annual action plans should be developed in **Excel** to facilitate their development, the breakdown of activities between different actors and their coherence with the plans of districts as well as their monitoring and evaluation. The report template which has just been developed should be copied into Excel to facilitate its use.

data it will contain will prove difficult.	

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Communication Systems	In order to contact people, agents use their director's fixed line telephone for outside calls and with their colleagues they most often just move within the ministry building. They **do not share any materials on the network** (printer, scanner, telephone). **Paper correspondence remains the tool that is the most recognised** and the most often used in order to communicate.	Put in place E-communications which are based on the following tools depending on the different types of communications: **professional** mobile phone for urgent messages, IT telephony reserved for professional use only, professional instant messaging such as Microsoft Exchange to allow management of communications on a network, utilisation more systematic of emails for all transmission of written messages. Rules on the usage of email should be codified.
Information System	By the end of the year MINAGRI will have : - a Management Information System which will be implemented up to district level with a view to consolidating data and results - an Excel database for agriculture statistics - an Access database for Human Resources - software in the course of implementation dedicated to document management and archives. **Computer applications are not fully utilised** (no project management, no performance indicators). The software used should be improved for statistics and Human Resources. The document management system remains deficient. Documents produced by agents are not shared nor stored on the network in order to facilitate their use. Numerous pieces of work are still produced on notebooks with carbon copies, stamped and manually signed. With regards to the information system **MINAGRI has only just started using the services of RITA and NISR.** Finally, MINAGRI plans to implement a one-stop centre to better respond to the needs of users. Such a centre could equally be put in place in the agencies under the ministry's supervision and at each district level.	**The modernisation of the information system** is well underway. A new MIS system should be developed which would allow the ministry to monitor three major indicators: progress of national production towards food self-sufficiency, progress of the revenues of the rural world and progress of the percentage of farmers and livestock farmers who have converted to other activities. It should allow the further development of data (the Ministry's statistics in Excel and the NISR's data). Care should be taken to ensure the compatibility of applications in order to facilitate transfers of data. **Other suggestions :** Survey the applications used in projects and agencies to see how they can be made better use of : improve the HR database while awaiting MIFOTRA's database ; acquire in the medium term project management software for action plans; plan for trainings for the users concerned and a corresponding budget. **Document management** needs to be improved. MINAGRI has anticipated this need with the installation of a software package for document management and archiving. Documents created electronically need to be managed on a central server and automatically stocked on the network according to documentary norms. As a result, MINAGRI has two options: either the software package currently being installed can function on the network or if this is not possible other software exists on the market which can do this. **With regards to Human Resource Management** MIFOTRA must put in place the following management tools: a single database of all state employees; secure procedures for HRM (currently under review by the CIC); nomenclature of roles; directory of roles and posts; a reward system for individual performance; automated network of HR managers and decision-makers.

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Working procedures and processes	MINAGRI operates according to the **administrative procedures** currently in application by MINECOFIN for finance and by MIFOTRA for HR. These remain **bureaucratic** and underline just **centralised the decision-making process is**. A new manual for state Human Resource Management is currently at the level of the CIC and should be widely distributed as soon as it is officially published. A large number of administrative procedures in use are obsolete because of the modernisation of working tools, the implementation of a performance management system, a job-based public service, the delegation of responsibility to directors and the opening up of services (if these last two proposals are accepted). **MINAGRI does not have specific procedures** (no controls of results, revision of strategic plans or of annual action plans etc…) and no unit has responsibility for this.	An E-Administration needs to be put in place: - Through **improved use of computerised tools for dealing with information** (cf Equipment below) - Through **revision of procedures in use** which concern mostly the budget and HR. As soon as it is adopted the new Human Resources Management manual should be widely publicised. However, other management procedures still need to be reviewed, developed and captured: correspondence management; administrative management; document management; development of strategic and action plans; procedures for districts; user guides etc… Each procedure should be exhaustively examined in order to result in a manual which can be submitted to the appropriate authorities for approval. On publication, agents should be trained so that they conform to the procedures, respect them and so that they use effectively the automated support which are produced as a result. MINAGRI should develop its own procedures (e.g. development and revision of the strategic plan). This function could be outsourced or internalised.
Organisation of work and time management	Time management is a **major problem. The management of other people's emergencies** prevails to the detriment of each unit's own activities. With the exception of some managerial level staff who share their diaries with their assistants, professionals do not share with diaries (if they have one) either with colleagues or with the secretary of their unit. This system does not allow secretaries to **filter requests for ad hoc meetings nor to prioritise planned meetings.** The planning function also believes itself to be under the obligation of dealing with emergencies and yet its role should be to help to limit the number of interruptions.	Time management is necessary in order to make productivity gains. The management of time is eased by the implementation of rigorous procedures and tools designed for each work situation. It is suggested that MINAGRI should introduce a new system for time management (planning of meetings and principles to be respected); electronic diaries; meetings agreed by a secretary (to facilitate filtering and priorities).

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Human Resource and Performance Management System	**A Human Resource Management system for civil servants** is missing because the appropriate tools have not yet been put in place by MIFOTRA, including: - National policies for managing civil servants with regards to: training, recruitment, career development, salaries etc… - Related management tools: Nomenclature of roles; directory of the roles and posts; system of individual performance rewards (currently being examined by the Cabinet); Single database of state employees; secure Human Resource procedures (currently being examined by the CIC); automated network for managers and decision-makers; - A remuneration system for posts which is based on the profession, the acquired experience and individual performance. **Institutional performance contracts** put in place for agencies under its supervision have indicators which do not reach as far as the actual impact of the activity and therefore their usefulness is limited. **The system of evaluation of agents** which has just been adopted **requires adequate tools** to fix the objectives of agents and to give them the means to reach them (in terms of tools, training and availability because they are often asked to do other activities). **Their mobility** is disturbing the system. Finally, no system is planned at present for remunerating individual performance.	**The Management of the State's Human Resources** based on the new statute should allow the State to: control the matching of needs and personnel either existing or to be recruited; motivate personnel; plan for demographic evolution and needs in terms of both quality and quantity; have tools available to monitor the stability of the public Administration and its independence with regards to politics. To reach this state, the Reform of the Public Service should be completed and MIFOTRA must put in place the tools listed on the left. **Institutional performance contracts will be put in place.** They must specify objectives, resources employed to reach them and the results expected. Indicators must be identifiable and measurable but above all should be based on the real impact obtained in the field. They should cover all levels (Minister, Directors, Mayors etc…) **An individual performance evaluation system** is currently being examined by the Cabinet. It is based on the objectives negotiated at the start of the year by each agent and his or her hierarchical manager. The contract should cover measurable and realistic indicators and should be accompanied by the means to achieve the results (training, equipment etc…). To be viable, this system requires agents that can stay in their role for at least the period of the performance contract. In addition, a fund should be put in place to remunerate individual merit (see the proposal on savings made or reintroduce experience in the remuneration system). **Contracts for Technical Assistance** could stipulate the obligation to transfer know-how (cf. SWAPs). As compensation, the obligations of the Rwandan party would be met notably by providing the mean and monitoring the retention of trained agents. Finally, MIFOTRA should revise official arrangements taken to: reintroduce the importance of professional experience for certain roles; regulate the free mobility of agents in institutions by giving preference to internal recruitment and by specifying the conditions of access to external competition. It would be equally useful to calculate the cost of current staff turnover within MINAGRI.

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
MINAGRI's Resources *Finance*	**The budget for training** of the ministry covers in part its needs. The ratio of staff costs to training budget is around 30% both for the ministry and the agencies under its supervision. This ratio is about the norm. However, MINAGRI's budget is lacking in terms of training, which is a method that should be prioritised in order to modernise the institution. On this subject there is no capitalization of the know-how developed by projects and the cost of certain budgetary posts do not represent a return on investment. **The investment budgets** are completed by projects and requests to sponsors (a solution favoured by the agencies)	MINAGRI should be in a better position to negotiate with MINECOFIN on its operations and investment budget if the needs expressed are better justified by solid arguments. It should validate its results not only in relation to its objectives but in relation to the benefits obtained in the field. Elsewhere, savings can be generated: by the systematic use of modern tools which allow the use of new technology (decrease in spend on paper, telephony etc...); by the adoption of new working methods, by the systematic research for ways of optimising costs (e.g. the mutualisation of training, joint field visits etc…). These sources of savings could be invested in the fund which is proposed to reward individual performance.
Equipment	MINAGRI has sufficient appropriate equipment which benefits from new technology. All agents have an office computer and a printer. The ministry also has photocopiers, scanners etc... It invests in new communication equipment: server; intranet; IP and video conferencing will be installed before July. With regards to computer applications, MINAGRI is in the process of acquiring a Management Information System which will be ready before the end of the year. Nonetheless the Word application currently used to develop and monitor strategic and action plans and to carry out monitoring and evaluation must absolutely be abandoned and Excel and/or Access used instead while waiting for the ministry to acquire project management software. The small size of some offices does not meet minimum ergonomic norms.	The security and safety of computer systems and applications need to be strengthened: Security and safety of materials and of the network; security and safety of data. MINAGRI's intranet should have a security system including: - Control of access to the network, to servers and to workstations - Control of access to documents - Control of access to different functions of applications - Definition of responsibilities of network and user administration - Automatic filter of internet access by type of site and by priority - Implementation of an automatic data saving system MINAGRI should try to use Excel or Access to develop strategic and action plans while waiting to acquire project management software. It would be equally useful to survey all of the applications used in projects to identify the possibility of them being used by other entities and therefore generate a better return on investment and rationalisation of the costs of technical assistance. In all cases, training of staff in the use of computer applications should be planned.

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Human Resources of the Agriculture Sector	In order to make use of its entire workforce, MINAGRI must complete its staff. Recruitment that is open to the job market is a factor of demotivation and penalises the management of careers which the Administrative Reform is aiming for. Recently filled posts are held by young people with little experience. The average age is 36.5 years and 3.5 years of experience in the position. The overall turnover is 26%. **With regards to the staff of Districts and Sectors** The agents in charge of agriculture should have knowledge in a variety of specialities which one single agent cannot master. The workload which is the result of the diversity of their activities in large geographical zones poses a real problem of availability. The lack of veterinary agents to monitor activities of livestock farming reinforces the problem. This specialist domain faces a deficit at a national level and in the public Administration in particular.	**The Ministry** must complete its staff as soon as possible. To achieve this and while waiting for the tools provided by MIFOTRA, the ministry could: - Define the posts to be filled using appropriate criteria - Recruit new staff on the basis of competence and verify the quality of tests with regards to the capacities demanded. In order to maintain competences and because of turnover, MINAGRI should attempt to encourage agents to stay with the institution by : - enforcing the rule which aims to retain agents for a given period after they have benefited from training. This arrangement must be enforced more rigorously. With regard to trainings, the ministry's specialists should have the right to review the contents and quality of trainings given in order to develop skills and in anticipation of the future. - consider voluntary early retirement of those who wish to do so in order to open up positions to younger people who can benefit from the assistance of the existing job holder. This person can train the younger person part time and would receive payment for this based on a part of his or her former salary and the younger person benefits from on the job training. **At district and sector level**, suggestions are being examined to increase the number of staff and to review the recruitment criteria of agents responsible for livestock farming.

The proposals below concern the reorganisation of the services of MINAGRI but can only be taken into account following an exhaustive functional review of the agencies under its supervision, projects and districts. This recommendation is essential so that the conclusions which are presented can be accepted by the leadership of MINAGRI.

Additional Fields of Investigation	Assessment	PROPOSALS
Organisation of MINAGRI and the agriculture sector	MINAGRI's structure matches the **standard** MIFOTRA model which allows for 3 hierarchical structures and 3 to 4 units maximum of which 1 is Planning, Policy and Sector Strategies. With regards to organisation, in principle, the structure should reflect the key areas of activity. **The location of projects** at the level of the ministry is contrary to the externalisation of operational activities. This reduces the potential to really profit from experience and results in losses when the project ends and the staff leave together with the know-how they have acquired. It does not allow for economies of scale to ensure a return on investment of the means and to support cooperation. **The organisation of districts** should be reviewed to better meet expectations and rationalise the skills required.	The organisation of MINAGRI should reflect its areas of activity. A new organogram is propose in which: the technical dimension of the sector policy of the ministry is apparent; the support services are re-grouped within one unit (including ICT); the majority of projects are positioned within the relevant agencies. The proposal for an inspection function has been abandoned while the monitoring and evaluation and capacity building functions have been strengthened. The creation of a one-stop-centre is also planned by the ministry to inform third parties. The requests to organisations which were created to serve the institutions of the state (RITA, REMA, RBS and NIS) should be systematised. The organisation of districts is in the process of being reviewed to strengthen the number of staff, in particular by re-employing or contracting A2 veterinary staff where there is a significant lack to ensure cattle have some health monitoring.
Distribution of missions and responsibilities	**The cadre organique of MINAGRI** shows distortions between activities and their effective implementation by the post holders. The reasons are: **lack of an effective sense of responsibility**; lack of appropriate tools; lack of training but also; **lack of understanding of MINAGRI's role.** MINAGRI's professionals in charge of strategies, policies and annual action plans are facilitators. They call on outside consultants in order to fulfil their tasks.	The distribution of responsibilities should be revised to correspond to the project organisation which is proposed (assuming it is also accepted). In addition, it is necessary to review the contents of the cadres organiques so that they genuinely meet the needs and the profiles required to fulfil the responsibilities of each role. Either the contents of the CO are not correct and must be reviewed or it is correct and the agents should be given the means to complete their activities in full.

1st SECTION- REMINDER OF THE OBJECTIVE AND APPROACH OF THE MISSION

1   MISSION OBJECTIVES

The present functional review of MINAGRI was requested by MIFOTRA. It aims to measure the consequences of the decentralisation and externalisation of the ministries' operational services which was decided upon in 2006. This study has been entrusted to a team of mixed consultants (international and local experts) to successfully complete the audits of the national institutions of Rwanda.

MINAGRI has undergone two functional reviews, in August 005 and September 2006 following decentralisation. As a result the present mission focused on:

- the implementation and impact of the measures recommended by the audits of 2005/2006
- an audit of new areas which were not covered in the previous analyses

- seeking a consensus with the managerial staff and leadership of MINAGRI on the recommended measures and on additional solutions identified.

This report covers the diagnosis of the current situation at MINAGRI and on proposals for improvement as validated by both manager and leaders of the ministry.

It is complemented by a global report which is a synthesis of the functional reviews of the other ministries audited. Their consolidation allows for an inventory of suggested improvements which are common to all of the state's institutions. This report identifies any possible financial implications of proposals put forward and presents the solutions according to how quickly they can be implemented:

- those that are immediate and/or easily implemented with quick results (quick wins),
- those that are short term (next year),
- those that are medium term, generally more political and which require consultation and approval by the highest authorities (especially those concerning laws or regulatory texts)

The point of departure of the mission was the recommended improvements in the previous functional reviews of MINAGRI in 2005/2006 and their implementation. Those recommendations are in the following table:

- **INCREASE COLLABORATION WITH DECENRALISED ENTITIES and REINFORCE SYNERGIES WITH THE MINISTRIES THAT INFLUENCE THE SECTOR :** increase their involvement in the process and communication between different actors; create liaisons with ministries that have activities that impact agriculture[1]

- **IMPROVE SERVICES TO THE POPULATION:** Capitalise on experience (reciprocal consolidation of know-how/techniques used and the results obtained); develop a customer service oriented-culture in the public service.

- **IMPROVE THE INFORMATION SYSTEM (quality and availability of data and statistics)**: install a solid database to fix objectives and measure the impact of agricultural policy and orient strategies and action plans on tangible and verifiable results.

- **IMPROVE THE SKILLS OF MINAGRI STAFF:** Train staff on planning, on support and monitoring of development and provide technical training.

- **PROPOSE THE CREATION OF AN INSPECTION UNIT:** control the activities of different actors in the agriculture sector

---

[1] Agriculture is dependent on other key sectors such as infrastructure, water and sewerage, environment, land use, the private sector for development and finally the decentralised administration. Only tight collaboration between the parties involved can guarantee the success of sector reforms thanks to synergies that would be brought about by the coordination of activities

These fields have been further developed through detailed study of the following areas:

- Mandate, mission and responsibilities of the ministry based on policy and sector strategies

- Structure and organisation

- Method of developing sector strategic plans and annual action plans and respect of decentralised missions

- Method of monitoring and evaluation of results and performance

- Information system and document management

- Communication system, internal and external (functional relationships)

- Resources and means available

- Management (including time management)

2 PARTICIPATIVE APPROACH

In order to ensure the professionals and managers concerned take ownership of the work, the approach adopted to establish the diagnosis involved the participation of interlocutors and the search for a consensus on the recommendations and suggested solutions and the methods and means to achieve them. This approach involved several stages:

- Search for useful information :
  - Analysis of documents and information transmitted by MINAGRI
  - Meetings with the professionals of the ministry, directors of the agencies under its supervision, project coordinators and professionals from two districts.
- Consolidation of information gathered, analysis of trouble spots which remain and the search for possible solutions;
- Workshop to present the gaps identified preventing the ministry from achieving the optimal situation and proposed solutions; search for a consensus; criticisms and changes. Those people interviewed together with other agents of MINAGRI participated in the workshop cf. annex 1 list of people interviewed.
- Further development of the report based on remarks made during the workshop
- Presentation of results to the leadership of MINAGRI, taking into account comments made ;
- Writing the final report for MINAGRI ;
- Final consolidated report for MIFOTRA presenting the synthesis of the functional reviews by the ASI team.

Key Principles

The decision of 2004/2005 centred on the reduction of staff and the necessary reorganisation of the Administration is an indispensable and irrevocable activity which allowed for the rehabilitation of the public service in Rwanda.

This decision however, made obsolete the main regulations and management systems.

The proposed recommendations must, as a result, allow the Administration to better operate while rehabilitating the management systems without fundamentally questioning the reform process underway.

1st SECTION – REVIEW OF THE CURRENT SITUATION AT MINAGRI

3   POLITICAL, LEGAL AND REGULATORY ENVIRONMENT

The current situation at MINAGRI is marked by its legal and regulatory environment cf. annex 2 – Principal reference texts on the legal and regulatory environment. The recent evolution of the Administration has had an effect on all state institutions. The present audit has taken this into account in the recommendations. The paragraphs below summarise:

- Notable facts which mark the environment of this ministry (historic) ;

- Founding texts of the Government's policies (political framework) ;

- The new concept of the Public Service (regulatory texts)

3.1   History of the reforms

Since the beginning of the decade, the Rwandan Government has committed itself with determination to two structural programmes targeting the general development of the country and the fight against poverty. Thus major reforms have been undertaken including that of the Public Service which started in 2000 and which is still being implemented. This reform goes hand in hand with two major initiatives: good governance and the management of institutions based on the efficiency of all public services (ministries, agencies, specialist establishments etc…).

The reform of the public service should allow the state to have institutions which serve the population that are capable of ensuring that basic needs are being satisfied and reducing the problems of communities.

These new orientations of the Public Service have resulted in necessary structural modifications. These progressive changes have taken place in several stages in 2004, 2005 and 2006. The last, more important was focused on:

- The redefinition of the roles of central and local Administration ;

- The change in the Public Service statutes so it is a system based on posts ;

- The reduction in staff linked to the use of new technology ;

- The revision of the salary structure.

The reorganisation of institutions and the reduction of their staff[2] are actions which are irrevocable and aimed to rehabilitate the Public Service to be more efficient and better value for money.

The major decision – to refocus ministries on their leadership role, to externalise operational activities, to decentralise the state's services to better serve the population and to have a job-based Public Service – led to a complete rupture with the way the Administration was organised previously. Therefore at present national institutions are operating according to old practices which are therefore not adapted, not codified and not standardised.

All of the texts regulating the Administration have to be re-written, in particular the regulatory framework, working procedures, the modalities and methods of cooperation, standards and shared management tools and methods for implementing the reforms, delegation of signatures, decision-making etc… All these new arrangements remain to be defined and should be carried out and implemented in a consultative way including all participants.

---

[2] Agents whose jobs were eliminated have been redeployed, They have either been transferred into other public institutions are oriented towards the Public Service re-conversion programmes to improve their capacities before being reintegrated into the Public Service or being helped with professional reinsertion outside the Public Service or – for those of the appropriate age – retiring.

These changes profoundly modified the mission and the staff of MINAGRI because of the decentralisation and the implementation of the Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EDPRS).

3.2 Government's policy framework - VISION 2020 / EDPRS

All national policies, strategies and sector action plans are determined in Rwanda by the fundamental documents below:

- Vision 2020 (written in November 2002) which fixes the major axes and objectives for the country to achieve by 2020 and which serves as a pillar for all national sector policies.

- The EDPRS which covers 5 years from 2003 and which identifies the objectives, priorities and action plans for each sector of activities and priority area of the state.

3.3 Texts governing the Administration

To support the fundamental national policies mentioned above (Vision 2020 and EDPRS), in May 2002 the Government adopted the Policy Framework for the Reform of the Public Service (PCRFP) which defines the objectives and main axes of the Public Administration.

It is on this that the strategic plan and implementation of the Programme of Reconfiguration and Transformation of the Rwandan Public Administration are based. This programme sets out the measures and the activities to be undertaken to be in line with Vision 2020 and to support the economic growth and development of the country.

With the same aim, the texts regulating the personnel of the state institutions required significant changes, such as the Statute for civil servants and the Working Code as well as the law on decentralisation.

3.3.1 Decentralisation

A number of texts (laws and policies) underlie decentralisation including the document from November 2006 "The Efficiency of Decentralised Services" [3]. This text specifies – in its annex 1 – the role of central ministries and that of the districts which have to be in synergy with the national policies and strategies and take into account the aspirations of the local populations.

3.3.2 Statute for agents of the Public Service

Law n° 22 /2002 from 09 /07/2002 on the General Statute of the Public Service is currently in force. The majority of MINAGRI's agents and agencies under its supervision are agents of the state[4] and are covered by this text.

The Statute of the Public Service provides for the deployment of agents in an institution using a cadre organique. This support allows agents to be moved from one post to another to fill vacancies and to facilitate the matching of people with posts. It is in the form of a table showing the organisation of each institution broken down into units, the roles and the posts in each with the required profile, their number and whether they are filled or vacant.

Following the decision taken in 2002 to implement a job-based Public Service, the current Statute is no longer appropriate. Thus a new Statute has been written and is currently with parliament.

---

[3] **«**Making Decentralized Service Delivery Work in Rwanda**»** Annex 1 pages 62 and 63 that stipulates the role of MINAGRI.

[4] According to the article 1 of the Statute "Considered as a Government employee, is any person carrying out a job under the form of a working post within the Rwandan Public Service, an dis paid out of funds made for public interest."

3.3.3 The labour code

This law from 2002 stipulates regulations which cover workers in the private sector. The Administration can recruit such people. They are called "contractors" within the Public Service in reference to the contract for work which is stipulated in the Labour Code[5]

MINAGRI and its agencies call on this type of agent using employment contracts that are renewable. They reinforce the staff on urgent activities. They also work on projects (PSTA, PADEBEL, RSSP, PAIGELAC, PADAB, etc.).

These contractors do not appear in the cadres organiques. The posts they fill are described at vacant.

3.3.4 System of pay currently in force

The salary policy is an integral part of the policy for the management and development of the state's human resources. From that point of view, it should contribute to the institution's ability to attract and retain skilled staff in the public service cf. Annex 3 – brief presentation of the new pay system.

In order to do this, the principles retained by the guide from June 2004 on setting salaries in the public sector plans for a system which is fair, motivating, related to activities, but which should also contribute to the maintenance of a total wages bill which can be met by state finances. To this end, a new pay scale was established and came into force at the beginning of 2006.

These new arrangements – which take into account the reduction in the number of staff – has allowed for an overall increase in salaries of about 100 to 150%.

Notwithstanding this fair policy, the remuneration of ministry agents and those of projects and agencies varies significantly. The current transitional pay system does not meet the objective of a dynamic management of staff which takes into account the results of individual performance and career management.

---

[5] Article 2 of the Labour Code stipulates "An employee in this law is any person, regardless of his/her sex and nationality who has undertaken to put his/her professional activity, for pay, under the direction and the authority of another person, natural or public or private organisation."

4 ANALYSIS OF MINAGRI

MINAGRI is currently THE key ministry necessary to the transformation of Rwanda. Responsible for the agricultural and animal breeding sector, it currently has the eminent strategic role of achieving the formidable challenge which aims to change the current configuration of the country to reduce by 2020 from 87% to 50% of the population living from agriculture. It requires a modernisation of the sector, development of agro-industry and to a lesser extent, the informal sector so that 37% of the population can be converted onto new activities in 12 years.

MINAGRI's situation is determined by:
- Its mandate, missions and responsibilities ;
- Its regulatory framework (statute of the Public Service and pay system);
- Its structure and organisation ;
- Its methods for developing and monitoring its strategic and action plans ;
- Its resources (finances ; equipment ; staff) ;
- Its functioning and that of its services (information system; management system; functional relationships; management style).

4.1 Mandates, missions and responsibilities

MINAGRI's mandate, its missions and organisation are not explained in any regulatory or legal text. They are identified via the framework texts already mentioned (Vision 2020 and EDPRS) and the Millennium Development Goals (MDG). The missions of MINAGRI as expressed in these texts are:

- Food self-sufficiency for the country ;
- Modernisation of agriculture to increase the revenues of farmers and to develop exports ;
- A change in rural areas which will account for 50% of the population in 2020.

These texts have served as a guide for MINAGRI to establish the necessary support for the progress of its medium and long term activities, including:

- The national agricultural policy which aims to increase the productivity of the sector and to improve the food security of the country while reducing the number of people living from agriculture whilst ensuring sustainable and participative management of natural resources ;
- The 2 strategic plans for the Transformation of Agriculture in Rwanda (PSTA) which target the radical changes which the new agricultural policy wants to introduce.

4.1.1 The National agriculture policy

This document is dated February 2004. It was developed with the participation of the majority of central and regional institutions who are involved in the sector as well as donors and private operators. It covers:

- The objectives of the agricultural policy and its directing principles.
- The 4 strategic axes to be followed (which should be the basis of annual action plans) :
  - Transformation and modernisation of the sector,
  - Development of new fields
  - Promotion of the competitiveness of products,
  - Development of entrepreneurialism in the sector.
- Support activities for the implementation of this policy : capacity building ; decentralisation ; coordination of sector programmes;

- Challenges to be overcome;

- Strengths and weaknesses of the sector ;

- Objectives and the sector and inter-sector programmes to be carried out within agriculture and livestock farming: productivity; conservation of soil; mechanisation; research and development; development of new fields; financing and supervision of the rural world; land ownership etc…

- The institutional framework for implementation and the partners involved, which plans for the creation of :

  - A multi-disciplinary unit responsible for the evaluation of needs, allocation of resources, coordination of programmes and technical assistance,

  - A council of agro-business and marketing bringing together MINAGRI, ISAR, RIEPA and RBS.

The National Agricultural Policy is still in force. It does not specify an end date. It is the main reference with the EDPRS that guides the priorities and options which are focused on in the Strategic Plan for the Transformation of Agriculture.

4.1.2   The Strategic plan for the transformation of agriculture

These two documents were finalised in October 2004 and anticipate the development of the sector until 2008.

The Strategic Plan for the Transformation of Agriculture (PSTA) has a presentation of the context of agriculture and a sector analysis of different resources and production then sets out the various priority programmes to be implemented and their expected results. It proposes a provisional national plan over 4 years (until 2008) and an indicative financing plan.

The second strategic plan specifies the new fields with added value that can be developed as a priority but without action plans or financing. It also finishes at the end of 2008 and gives indicators for the increase of production of the fields concerned.

These two documents focus on:

- The change from a subsistence economy to a market economy

- Progressive intensification and modernisation of the agricultural sector ;

- New distribution of roles and responsibilities between the various actors following decentralisation[6] ;

- New working methods relating to, among others, the adoption by MINAGRI of the Programme approach in order to achieve the objectives of its strategic plans.

4.1.3   The National annual action plans

Since 2005, MINAGRI's action plan is based on the national policy and strategic plans described above. It is developed each year and is a basis for the annual action plans for the agencies under its supervision (including those created in 2005).

These action plans are consistent with each other and are oriented towards the national objectives from Vision 2020 and EDPRS cf. annex 4:
4.1 – Coherence of Vision 2020/EDPRS/National Policy/MINAGRI Strategic Plans
4.2 – Consistency between annual action plans and strategic plans

---

Critical analysis of the mandate, mission, strategic and action plans of MINAGRI

---

[6] This conforms with the new policies regarding the disengagement of the State and decentralisation.

MINAGRI does not have a legal and regulatory text which defines clearly its current mission and mandate which are only identifiable through the documents mentioned (Vision 2020, EDPRS, PSTA). The missions, as defined in the cadre organique do not emphasise the important strategic objective that the ministry is responsible for achieving and which aims to significantly change the Rwandan population by 2020.

MINAGRI should more clearly explain its role and prerogative in relation to other state institutions and in particular district agents. To lead its activities the ministry should be able to cooperate effectively with all the partners working its sector (such as MININFRA, MINIRENA and MINALOC for the districts, among others). If at the highest level this consultation is clear, it is not the case at the district and sector level. However, MINAGRI should be able to get services and/or information from its agencies in particular because their contribution is key to the ability of the ministry to achieve its objectives.

These strategic plans which guide its annual action plans finish at the end of the year. They are currently being studied to ensure the continuation of the priority programmes which still need to be run in order to achieve the 2020 objectives. This study is being carried out on the same principle of consultation with actors and beneficiaries which was used for the plans for 2004-2008. The MINAGRI strategic plan which will guide its activities until 2012 will only be ready at the end of the year.

As a result the annual action plan for 2009 will be developed based on programmes which are not totally complete at the end of this year. There is therefore a significant risk that the budget allocated to MINAGRI next year will be reduced, which is contrary to what is planned in the EDPRS.

4.2 Specific regulatory framework and pay system

MINAGRI does not come under any statute or regulatory text in particular with the exception of those applicable to public services which are mentioned above in paragraph 33.

It conforms to the texts which cover the public Administration and which essentially deal with financial management and public accounting, human resource management and procurement as well as those covering the tender process. The ministry applies the circulars which it receives.

With regards to salaries, it should be noted that for roles that are equal (the same profession and level of responsibility etc…) agents receive the same salary. However, the levels of pay vary significantly between the ministry, its agencies and projects. The variation is around 50 to 70% for projects, from 35 to 50% for agencies and 30 to 40% for offices.

Critical analysis on the specific regulatory framework and pay system

In terms of internal regulations, MINAGRI like all other central ministries respects the arrangements which are in place for public institutions. As soon as it is adopted by parliament, the ministry will be able to use the new Statute to improve management of its human resources.

The pay system, as it appears from the audit, appears to be an important brake on motivation, the stability of staff and their ability to attract the best recruits. This situation is raised in all state institutions and does not only concern MINAGRI. However, it is all the more striking in this ministry which cannot compete with its own agencies, offices and projects to attract and retain the talent it requires. Marked by an unsustainable turnover of staff, it is suffering a major handicap to fulfil its missions.

The new Statute should allow the ministry to manage its staff in a more dynamic way because it is more focused on skills and objectives and it allows for flexibility in motivating staff (in particular with recognition of individual merit).

4.3　Structure and organisation

The diagnosis below on the organisation and services of MINAGRI cannot be validated definitively until after the functional review of the whole agricultural sector. This recommendation is essential for the recommendations below to be accepted by the leadership of MINAGRI.

4.3.1　Organisational structure

The latest version of the Cadre Organique was adopted in 2006 following the decentralisation and restructure or the ministries. This restructure was accompanied by a significant reduction in the number of staff and, in part, their transfer to districts.

The current organisation of the ministry has the **uniform** structure adopted in 2006 by all central ministries. As a result it has the following units:

- Cabinet of the Minister of Agriculture and Animal Resources
- Cabinet of the Secretary of State for Agriculture
- Secretary General
- Finance and Management of Internal Resources Unit
- ICT Unit
- Planning, Sector Policy and Capacity Building Unit

The cadre organique describes the various responsibilities and missions of MINAGRI and their distribution among the units and the posts. It also indicates the required profiles in order to ensure a correct matching of people to post.

The management, administration and support activities are clearly found in the Finance and Internal Resources Unit and in the ICT Unit but in contrast, the principle missions of the ministry are not in one single, clearly identifiable unit. Instead the missions are among the activities listed for various posts in the Planning, Sector Policy and Capacity Building Unit.

The current organogram cf annex 5 illustrates the outsourcing of operational activities. It confirms the refocusing of the ministry onto supervisory tasks with the creation of 3 autonomous agencies and the transfer of the two national offices for tea and coffee under the supervision of the ministry[7]. This organisational structure limits the number of hierarchical levels to 3 in order to reduce the decision-making process, but it does not resolve the problems of:

- bureaucracy
- centralisation of decisions
- compartmentalisation of the sector entities (ministry – agencies – institute – offices – projects) but also with districts and other ministries who have an influence on the sector.

Vertical links are given priority over transversal links even though these would facilitate the quality of services.

The total operational activities of the various entities are supported by 20 projects, 10 of which are funds provided by donors to support certain programmes. 9 projects are situated within the agencies concerned. 11 are situated with MINAGRI 2 of which are directly attached to the Secretary General. They are managed by the ministry at a financial level and in terms of contact with the donors. The projects cover the whole sector and their professionals contact agents working in units, agencies and decentralised entities without distinction.

Critical analysis of the organisational structure

---

[7] ISAR (Scientific Institution for Agricultural Research) was already under the supervision of the ministry.

MINAGRI's structure matches the **standard model** adopted by MIFOTRA which systematically an ICT Directorate in each institution. This option was adopted due to the importance given to new technology and the rarity of technicians. Nonetheless this option does not take into account either the size or the nature of ICT which are an internal resource similar to other support services. It is therefore questionable whether an ICT unit is needed when agriculture is at the centre of the ministry's mission but does not appear in its organisational structure?

Equally, the importance of Planning at the expense of activities which are more decisive than action plans and monitoring and evaluation should be reviewed. The importance of strategic plans and action plans is the basis of the challenges to be overcome and the raison d'être of MINAGRI. The best planning cannot have results if the action plans and strategies to achieve them are under-estimated.

The basic principles of organisational structure suggest that key sectors should appear in the structure, which allows budgets to be assigned.

As a result, MINAGRI would benefit from revising its organisation in order to better take into account and value its core areas of activity.

The position of projects outside agencies does not allow experience[8] to be capitalised nor does it stop the loss of valuable knowledge once the project ends and the staff leave together with the know-how they've acquired.

The creation of agencies has not been accompanied by a protocol to get the maximum return from activities which they have in common, such as field visits. As a result, each pursues its own evaluation activities individually[9]. Given the current situation with limited finance, consultation between these entities would allow an optimisation of resources and to reduce the number of meetings in the field.

Outsourcing of the operations at the heart of the entities under the ministry's supervision was done with the aim of easing relations and of bringing staff closer to the field. However, 'centralism' still prevails as well as a lack of communication between the ministry's units, its agencies, institutions and projects and with districts and other partners. This compartmentalisation prevents:

- economies of scale (better use of talents and means)

- the effective circulation of information and as a result the efficiency of services provided to the population

Savings made could be used for other purposes and in particular to reward individual merit.

4.3.2   The Distribution of missions, responsibilities, tasks

REMINDER: As designed, a cadre organique are target documents[10]. They reflect the ideal situation that an institution should try to achieve in an optimised environment. This choice requested by MIFOTRA aims to facilitate the design of a better organisational structure and to define the required skills to reach the expected level of efficiency.

The distribution and the ownership of missions, responsibilities and tasks in the cadre organique does not entirely reflect the activities actually carried out cf. annex 6 – Comparison between activities planned in the CO and real activities.

This is explained in part by the option to describe in the cadre organique the desirable situation. However, other reasons explain the distortion between actual activities and those planned in the cadre organique:

---

[8] Loss of know-how acquired in projects once they finish because agents leave to work elsewhere (which is contrary to the capacity building objective)

[9] Which is a waste of time, energy and money as much for the ministry and its agencies as for the district and sector agents operating in the field.

[10] This option for describing the ideal organisation was ordered by MIFOTRA in 2004.

- Either the formulation or the distribution of activities is not correct => they need to be reviewed

- Either there is a distortion between the contents of the cadre organique and the mission letters which specify the activities for each post => contents of all documents should be consistent

- Either the post-holders do not have the training or the required tools[11] to do the tasks asked of them or are not yet used to doing them => measures should be taken so that they can complete their work

In all cases, this indicates that the cadre organique are not considered to be a tool for the organisation of the institution nor management of Human Resources.

Critical analysis on the distribution of mission, responsibilities, tasks within MINAGRI

The formulation of activities – in cadres organiques – leaves open the interpretation of tasks. The cadre organique was designed to assist in a job-based public service focused on giving objectives and responsibility to agents, but it does not currently achieve its purpose.

MINAGRI's professionals have more a role of facilitator than specialist designing and steering strategic plans. They release tenders for external consultants to design plans and sector policies. They respond to the complaints of agencies, projects, districts and other field operators. If their activities do not evolve over time so that staff carry out all of the requirements of their post then the contents of the cadre organique should be revised to correspond more accurately to their tasks and to avoid training staff on activities which they will never have to carry out.

However, the fundamental activity of the ministry to steer the agricultural reform remains deficient because :

- half completed activities by professionals: they do not plan their work. Monitoring and evaluation activities are reduced to their most simple form[12] which cuts out part of their responsibilities. They lack visibility on their area which is the opposite of what is described in the cadre organique, because they lack an adapted computer application.
- badly defined role of MINAGRI versus its partners, which should be :
  * Facilitator for the entities under its supervision in order to allow them to better function : by negotiating their budget or their cadre organique based on solid arguments; by communicating key orientations and how to implement activities; by ensuring an equal distribution of missions between the entities[13]

  * An advisory and informing role for exterior partners which are other ministries, donors, districts and private operators in the agriculture sector : by ensuring a logical consistency and good synergy between the action plans of each so that their convergence contributes to achieving common objectives.

  * Guarantor to avoid duplication such as in 2005 when the creation of an Agency of norms and standards for agriculture was abandoned because RBS existed (Rwandan Bureau of Standards).

4.4   Development and monitoring of strategic plans and action plans

These documents are developed on the basis of the National Agricultural Policy from 2004 and the direction provided by the EDPRS for the agricultural sector.

---

[11]   The ministry does not yet have software packages which facilitate the work of its agents (MIS, project management etc).

[12]   They do not at any value to the information treated. They should in fact present justified proposals with a budget and accompanied by models to help choices and to organise priorities – which is not the case at present.

[13]   ISAR is still responsible for disseminating information instead of and on behalf of agencies (RADA, RARDA, RHODA) and does not collaborate with the project on the dissemination of information that has been put in place at MINAGRI last year.

4.4.1   Method of developing strategic plans, action plans and the budget at central level and decentralised

A/ Strategic Plans

Strategic plans were developed in a mostly participative way in October 2004 in consultation with the Directors of MINAGRI at the time, local opinion leaders, districts, projects and donors.

These strategic plans target the transformation of agriculture within the framework of directives given by Vision 2020 and the first EDPRS programme from 2002-2008.

They served as a basis for professionals at MINAGRI to define annual action plans for the ministry and for agencies under its supervision to judge by the consistency of activities in the plans from 2006, 2007 and 2008.

Established to cover the same period as the EDPRS, they finish in 2008. The strategic plans were finalised by external consultants. A new study is underway which should allow them to be continued until 2012. This extension of the strategic plans will be entrusted to a team of consultants which will work in close consultation with all of the other actors and beneficiaries of the agricultural sector. The final document is expected at the end of the year.

B/ Action Plans

MINAGRI professionals develop annual action plans for the ministry on the basis of the strategic plans mentioned above in consultation with the agencies under its supervision which are executive bodies of the ministry and act at a higher level than the districts which are responsible for implementation cf annex 7 – Development of annual action plans.

Agencies develop their own annual action plans based on the ministry's plan from which they take different lines which are related to their area of speciality. As far as possible, the action plans at these two levels take into account the results provided in the district performance contracts (Imihigo: Agriculture section).

Nonetheless, the investigations carried out in 2 districts show that it is possible to have a disjoint between these action plans which focus on the implementation of the national policy for transforming agriculture and those of the districts which are the executive arm of the ministry. In fact, the districts write their own action plans based on the needs they have identified and the results achieved during the previous period. They verify nonetheless that their plan is consistent with national strategies (to the extent that they consider the documents to be working tools – which is not always the case). This quasi rupture between the action plans of the agencies and those of the districts is a serious handicap in validating the progress of national plans and putting them into action in the field. This rupture is even more complete with other partners who are:

- Donors (including NGOs) and the private sector operating in agriculture

- Other institutions and agencies of the state with an influence on the sector, including: Minirena, Mininfra, Mineduc, Minisante etc… whose action plans should be in synergy with that of MINAGRI so as not to risk impeding the latter's work in its sector.

The sector functional review which has been requested should ratify or reject this rapid diagnosis which nonetheless takes into account the audits from 2005/2006.

C / The budget for action plans

The investment budget for MINAGRI covers national action plans. It is based in part on the budgets presented by the entities under its supervision and in part on the budgeted estimations which each professional at the ministry in charge of an area calculates[14].

The consolidation of action plans and their budgets is done by the Planning Unit. Modifications can be carried out at that level. In addition, the budgets (for functioning and investment) of all ministry units are consolidated to be presented in the first instance to MINECOFIN in June.

MINAGRI's budget therefore follows the normal process set out by the Ministry of Finance for all of the state's institutions cf annex 8 – Budget procedure. The Finance Law is voted in December that allocates respective and definitive budgets to each institution. This procedure is followed by all autonomous entities under the supervision of MINAGRI.

With regard to districts they are supposed to generate their own budget through the taxes they collect locally. The reality for the majority of districts (because of the poverty of the population) means that their budgets are essentially dependent on resources allocated via the state from the national budget.

Budgets and district annual action plans include an agriculture element. This is made up of:

- part of the budgets allocated by MINECOFIN to districts

- finance from operations carried out by NGOs

- a small contribution from local taxes

However, the granting of a budget by MINECOFIN is linked to the consistency of the activities listed in the district plans and MINAGRI's national action plan.

Budgets granted after final negotiation are not sufficient either for MINAGRI or for the entities under its supervision which look for other sources of finance through projects and sponsors, among others.

In districts, the budget allocated by MINECOFIN is equally insufficient. The difference is made up by local NGOs which finance their own activities or it is made up by agencies that pass necessary funds to districts to cover certain chargeable activities (e.g. vaccinations) which the districts later repay with the funds generated from the fee paid by the population who have benefited.

Monitoring the action plan budget. It is currently difficult for the professionals of MINAGRI responsible for national action plans to make a link with the budge lines allocated to agriculture. The budget lines can:

- totally finance a programme without being broken down to the level of activities which in the action plan are distributed between various operations or activities.

- feature in the budgets of several agencies or projects to finance different parts of the same programme.

As a result, monitoring the execution of the budget in synchronisation with the implementation of the action plans proves to be a delicate exercise but which is not impossible. The verification of this consistency between the budget execution and the implementation of action plans could be used as an indicator in order to evaluate the level of implementation of national plans at all levels. This approach necessitates giving the professionals an adequate software package and it would be a different and richer approach than the current zero-balance approach which is currently in place.

---

[14] To do this they use the price indicators given by MINICOM with whom they have contacts or even by the Council of Agro-business and Marketing which meets twice a month at district level.

> **Critical analysis on the elaboration of strategic plans and annual action plans**
>
> **Strategic plans in the agriculture sector** arrive at the end in 2008. The study which will result in them being updated and extended to 2012 will only be finished at the end of this year. As a result, the 2009 action plan will be based on the programmes that have activities which have not be achieved as planned at the end of the year. The risk is that the budget for 2009 will be reduced because of a lack of strategic plan – if this happens it will be a contradiction of the EDPRS[15] (2008/2012) which advocates an annual 6% increase in the budget allocated to agriculture.
>
> **Evaluation of action plans through budgets** gives interesting indicators to improve things. For the moment, professionals plan to achieve zero balance. They do not have other indicators which would allow:
>
> - to better defend on a solid basis the budget negotiations with MINECOFIN
>
> - to better highlight sensitive issues to monitor and facilitate requests for funds and their prompt payment
>
> - to measure the synergies which would allow for economies of scale. For example by consolidating field visit budgets between entities.
>
> With such an approach it is feasible to see how over time the efficient use of state funds can be improved by increasing the co-contribution of budgets (national, those of districts, those of NGOs and of projects financed by donors).
>
> MINAGRI currently does not have an appropriate tool to carry out this type of connection which would also benefit the monitoring activities of the action plan which also need to be strengthened.
>
> Finally, the dependence of districts with regard to the national budget is an argument in favour of greater consolidation of action plans at all levels (agencies, institutes, offices, projects, districts). The role of coordinator that MINAGRI should play is particularly necessary here so that budgets allocated are distributed optimally through the country and so that action plans are consistent.
>
> The ministry cannot - in the current situation - ensure this coordination because of the lack of a tool to steer the sector which penalises the budgetary priorities at a national level.

4.4.2   System of monitoring and evaluation of performance at central and decentralised level

The function monitoring and evaluation of performance at MINAGRI is not really taken on anywhere in the current conditions. And yet the performance of an institution is measured by the quality of its action plans (evaluation of the services of the units and entities under supervision) and by the services of its agents.

A/Evaluation of the implementation of the annual action plan of MINAGRI is based on:

- Indicators listed in the action plans

- Execution of the budget. This indicator shows that MINAGRI achieves its objectives (zero balance).

In the present situation, this indicator loses its value given the level of resources allocated. In addition, it is too global to give a more detailed appreciation of performance achieved by each entity (units and institutions under supervision).

In order to improve the monitoring and evaluation activities of the annual action plan, MINAGRI has developed a report template which has been distributed to districts. This support has just been introduced and has not yet been tested, which does not allow a validation of the quality of the

---

[15] The 2nd phase of EDPRS was approved in September 2007

feedback that it will generate. This support aims to anticipate the performance contracts which will be put in place this year.

The performance of MINAGRI should be measured based on concrete results recorded in the field in relation to the national annual action plan for agriculture. Its level of performance is therefore closely linked to the results obtained by the various partners and districts under the supervision of MINALOC in particular.

As a result, the national action plans that the MINAGRI is responsible for leading must remain its full responsibility. These action plans allow it to fulfil its mandate and to validate its strategic options and its consistency with those of the agencies under its supervision and the districts.

This necessitates a consistency between the national plan and the action plan of the various partners (those of the entities under its supervision, those of the districts and those of the ministries that have a role in the agricultural sector).

It is the responsibility of MINAGRI to monitor the effective coordination of all the activities carried out by various groups, which would clarify the mandate in relation to the professionals concerned.

Performance contracts have already been introduced since 2006 and 2007 in several entities under the supervision of the ministry (ISAR, RADA, RARDA etc…) and in the districts. They have been established for the first organisations taking into account their resources. For districts (Imihigo) they cover all of the areas to be developed, of which livestock farming and agriculture[16] are only one aspect.

MINAGRI should take the initiative to be in a position to meet its national engagements.

B/ The system of performance evaluation for agents is based on the system of grading of the public service.

Criteria used in the current system are based on tasks and not on action plans and objectives to be achieved. There is therefore not yet an actual evaluation of individual performance as would be necessary in a job-based public service where each agent signs an individual performance contract annually which lists specific objectives.

Critical analysis of monitoring and evaluation of performance at the central and decentralised level

The support (report template) introduced by MINAGRI to gather and evaluate the progress of the implementation of the annual action plan was developed in Word. This template is not adapted so that the data collected can be consolidated and used. Processing this data will necessitate re-entering it with all the risks of making mistakes that this entails. In addition it will not allow easy production of performance board showing the key performance indicators and targets.

A new system of performance evaluation of the Adminsitration has just been adopted by the Cabinet and will be implemented this year in all ministries. It responds to the new initiative to systematically introduce performance contracts at all levels.

Institutional performance contracts are new and still need to be improved to genuinely reflect the efficiency of services. The performance indicators that are included do not reflect the results obtained from activities.

Their extension to all agencies and institutions of the state should therefore be revised before being further implemented so that indicators are included that are better linked to the results obtained in the field and not only completing activities.

---

[16] Performance in the districts is measured uniquely on the completion of tasks that are in the action plan. It doesn't take into account the results in the field such as '% increase in production following the number of tonnes of fertiliser distributed'.

> **The system of evaluation of agents** which has just been adopted requires that from the start, institutions have the appropriate tools to set objectives for the agents on a sound basis. But in the current situation, agents do not have all of the elements they would need to allow them to be responsible for their own performance. They still to now know their tasks. They are asked to carry out other activities. They do not have detailed planning of their activities, nor a calendar specifying the deadlines.

4.5 MINAGRI's resources

4.5.1 Finances: budget, projects, donors, etc.

MINAGRI's financial means are made up of the budget provided by MINECOFIN. The operating budget roughly the current needs. We notice however for 2008 that:

- The section of the budget allocated to field visits AND to capacity building represents respectively 1.38% and 3.5% or less than 5% of the operating budget total

- The ratio between staff costs and training costs is around 30%[17], which is a correct proportion

Investment budgets allocated to the agriculture sector: The minister is involved in the distribution of the budget ceilings given to agencies under its supervision which are responsible for the implementation of the national action plans. All of these budgets contribute to achieving the objectives fixed by the ministry.

The overall assessment is that the agencies only receive part of the budget they have requested from MINECOFIN, between 30 and 70%[18]. The cuts are generally made on posts which are not considered a priority or which are not sufficiently justified by the proposed annual action plan.

Agencies and institutions therefore search for additional sources of finance, in particular via projects financed by donors or foreign partners (potential sponsors). The twenty or so projects operating in the sector (9 of which are with agencies) corroborates this fact.

> **Critical analysis of MINAGRI's finances**
>
> The operating budget should take more account of capacity building because the modernisation of the functioning of the ministry requires a significant effort in training to improve the efficiency and the productivity of agents. It would be useful:
>
> - to plan to increase significantly the training budget over the next few years
>
> - to develop the transfer of know-how from projects by situating them as much as possible within agencies
>
> The budgets planned for field visits could be better used if plans were better communicated so that joint field visits could be arranged between agencies and/or MINAGRI.
>
> The investment budget needs to go beyond the simple use of the procedure by providing more details justification for the activities so that choices and priorities are easier to identify.
>
> Finally it would be useful if MINAGRI had a computer application which would allow it to monitor budget spending in all agencies, programmes and institutions so that it can more easily follow the progress of the national action plan. This type of tool should also allow easier identification of areas in which funds can be more effectively used.

4.5.2 Other equipment

---

[17] This ratio is also 30% for the agencies and almost 58% for ISAR (because it is a research institute).
[18] RADA estimates that its budget is only covered at 33% and ISAR at 70%.

The ministry has buildings which are currently sufficient for the number of staff. Nonetheless the small size of some offices poses a problem for filing and security of documents.

ICT equipment is sufficient because each agent has a computer and a printer.

MINAGRI has other resources for information and reproduction (photocopiers etc...) cf annex 9 – Information system supports

With regard to the methods of communication, fixed line telephones are used but only within the ministry (not all agents have them). Only the Ministers, the Secretary General and the Directors have direct access to external lines. Agents all have a private mobile phone which they try to avoid using as much as possible because they are not reimbursed for the units they use.

Before the summer MINAGRI will invest in a new server and IP telephony and video conferencing equipment.

Critical analysis of MINAGRI's equipment

The small size of some offices does not meet norms of ergonomics. Efforts are being agreed to improve the working conditions and equipment (new desks, new cabinets etc…)

With regard to communication, new equipment will allow a significant improvement in the work of agents thanks to electronic transfers of information within the ministry, but also with the bodies under its supervision and the districts. This should generate some savings.

This modernisation of systems is a step in the right direction, towards the increased efficiency which was to come following the reduction of staff and the use of new technology.

Nonetheless to ensure complete efficiency this choice needs to be supported by decisions regarding the delegation of responsibilities, collaboration and de-compartmentalisation of services.

4.5.3   Human resources

A/ MINAGRI's Human Resources

The ministry lost almost 80% of its staff in the 5 years following the outsourcing of operations and decentralisation. This reduction was progressive with 145 agents in 2003, 69 in 2004, 56 in 2005 and 31 in 2006. This reduction of staff was also supposed to be supported by the introduction of new technology to improve the productivity of agents and to allow for the reduction in the number of posts in all institutions and in the central ministries.

The make up of MINAGRI's staff (cf annex 10[1][2][3] – Human Resources) is as follows

- A split of men/women respectively of 56% and 43%, which puts MINAGRI beyond the norms of Gender. Idem for posts with responsibility where the ratio is perfect (50/50)

- An average age of staff is 36.5 years

- The average time in the post is 3.5 years

- A level of formal education in which almost 70% of the agents have a university education or higher engineering qualification.

The training carried out by MINAGRI since 2005 has been mostly in ICT. In fact almost all agents have benefited from training on office applications. Despite this working methods and the supports used have not yet been modernised.

MINAGRI still has vacant posts from the cadre organique. Currently 12.5% of the posts have not filled since the change of Minister. Such a deficit has an effect on the posts of professionals

responsible for the development and evaluation of strategic and action plans and 12.5% of the posts are currently filled by contractors rather than agents of the state. This situation is due to the fact that the ministry has difficulties in recruiting and retaining staff[19]. The turnover experienced by the ministry is in fact critical:

- Since 2006 global turnover is 29% and for professionals is over 33% (which is dangerous for such a strategic ministry)

- Vacancies are filled by exterior recruitment, which penalises the management of careers that the Administrative Reform was supposed to install.

The main causes of this are linked to significant de-motivation among agents and this is in part due to:

- The transitory system of remuneration which does not remunerate either experience or competence or performance

- The careers of agents are not managed

- Appointments as based on insufficient criteria to guarantee proper matching of people to post (qualifications are given priority over experience)

- The system of training which is not monitored or followed up once the agent has returned to work and which despite the texts, does not attempt to control the departure of agents once they have been trained[20].

The increase in salaries in 2006 did not resolve the problem and shows that motivation is not uniquely a question of money.

B/ Agencies under the supervision of the ministry and districts

The human resources which the ministry has available in order to achieve its objectives should equally be measured by taking into account the existing staff in agencies and in districts (even if the latter come under MINALOC). In fact it is the entirety of the staff working in the agriculture sector that represents the resource that contributes to achieving MINAGRI's objectives. In total around **1150** state employees are working in the sector (excluding the ministry and local contractors).

The staff of the bodies working under the ministry are established by the cadres organiques which are validated by MIFOTRA[21]. They represent **550** agents who strengthen the projects with **150** agents.

The total staff of the districts working in the agriculture sector is **446** agents (excluding contractors). The configuration of district agents was decided in 2005 by MIFOTRA in consultation with MINALOC and is as follows:
- Within the 4 Provinces and Kigali City : 5 monitoring and evaluation district coordinators

- Within the 30 Districts : 30 professionals responsible for agriculture and livestock farming

- Within the 416 Sectors : 416 technicians responsible for agriculture, livestock farming and natural resources

The agents are structured using the standard model used in all districts and sectors. They are often A1 level agronomists and, to a lesser extent, veterinary surgeons. They come under the authority of the local mayor (and are dependent on MINALOC).

In sectors, out of the planned 5 agents 1 is responsible for agriculture, livestock farming, fishing, handcrafts, cooperatives and renewable resources. As a result he or she has to monitor and put in place action plans which come under MINIRENA, MINICOM and MINAGRI. This person must

---

[19] The person responsible bill payments is a former civil servant who was made redundant in 2006 for not having the required qualification, but who has been subsequently recruited back as a contractor because it has not been possible to recruit someone with the appropriate qualification.

[20] The free movement of people is the most common reason given for not being able to respect the clause stating that agents have to return to their post after training or to a similar post in the same institution.

[21] MINAGRI carries out the negotiations without the presence of those responsible in the agencies and the institutions concerned.

therefore have a multi-disciplinary profile: agronomist, veterinary surgeon, fishing expert, environmentalist, economist, commerce etc…

This structure does not take into account the specificities of the districts and sectors to the detriment of the rational use of staff and their abilities.

Critical analysis of MINAGRI's human resources and those of the agriculture sector

With regard to MINAGRI's staff and of the bodies under its supervision

The ministry must recruit to fill the gaps in its staff so that it has a full team and to lighten the current work load which burdens existing staff, in particular the staff of the Planning unit. External recruitment on the open market is the solution which has been prioritised until now in order to resolve the problem of under-staffing in all administrations. However, this option should only be the solution of last resort because it is a factor in the de-motivation of staff and it penalises the management of careers which was one of the objectives of the Reform of the Public Service.

Training – with the intention of strengthening staff abilities – is neither monitored nor evaluated once agents return to their posts. The current system does not guarantee that a trained agent will use what he or she has learnt, nor that the institution will be able to retain the person for long enough to pay for the investment in training (even if the texts supposedly control this). Trainings are not always adapted to needs[22] and are not stipulated in performance contracts as an additional means provided to achieve the objectives.

Finally, recently filled posts are held by younger people who do not really have sufficient experience. This situation is a factor which penalises the steering capabilities of the ministry:
- they have a lot to learn before they perform effectively

- they may leave the institution just at the moment when they are truly operational

With regard to the staff of districts and sectors

All partners complain about the lack of staff both at district and sector level. The current structure requires that they have knowledge in varied and specialised areas which one single agent cannot manage.

The workload which results from the diversity of activities to be carried out over large geographic zones (without any means of transport) poses a real problem. Not to mention that they can be asked to carry out lots of tasks, other than those which are part of their mission, by the local authorities upon whom they are dependent.

Moreover, the lack of veterinary agents to monitor the activities of livestock farming
reinforces this problem. This specialist area is in fact lacking at a national level and in particular in the public Administration. Following the departure of A2 technicians as a result of the decision in 2005, institutions have lost this type of specialist.

ISAR has decided to keep this category of agents in its ranks, a decision which turns out to have been the right choice. Equally, in some districts the directives have been overturned by the recruitment of agents who were made redundant as contractors.

4.6   Functioning of MINAGRI and of its services

4.6.1   Information system (including documentation and communication)

A/ Information System HARD

---

[22] The quality of documents obtained bring into question the efficacity of the ICT trainings which have been carried out.

As already indicated, MINAGRI has sufficient relevant and up to date equipment. The ICT infrastructure is sufficient. The ministry's website has been in place since 2005. The internal wifi network is linked to the internet. The physical network is appropriately secured.

At the level of the communication system, the ministry is going to make improvements thanks to a new server planned for this summer which will allow the installation of an Intranet network. IP communication tools, messaging and document transfer via the network will all be able to put in place. A video conferencing system will also be installed. On a related subject, the prodigious development of a national network which allows all districts and a large number of sectors to be linked should be noted.

B/ Information System SOFT

Efforts undertaken by MINAGRI to train agents have focused on improved usage of the computer applications installed at the ministry.

An information management tool will be put in place following the recommendations in the functional analyses of 2005/2006. An Australian company has been contracted to design and put in place this system (MIS). This tool should allow MINAGRI to have data available that is useful for following the development of its activities and their impact on the agriculture sector.

Other applications in use are:

- Microsoft Office (Word and Excel mostly)
- MINECOFIN applications for budgeting and/or managing staff (accounts, credits, capital, cash box etc...)
- A piece of software for logging and monitoring correspondence exists under Works but it is not on the network
- A piece of software in Access for managing human resources has been developed by a local company
- A statistical database in Excel requires some revision to improve its use in the network and to organise the level of consultations.

C/ Document Management System

The librarian has benefited from training in a software package currently being installed to improve the management of documents and the ministry's archives. Currently this software is not yet operational and the documents which arrive are always logged in old manual paper registers.

Each agent keeps his or her work documents and only shares them when requested to do so. The turnover of agents penalises the effective use and build-up of a document library belonging to the ministry because agents tend to leave and take with them the documents they have received in the course of their work.

Critical analysis of the information system

Despite the undoubted efforts of the ministry to modernise its services, the prevalence of old working methods continues. Modern systems of information, communication and documentation cannot be used optimally:

- Applications are still under-utilised (they are not used to analyse data, to develop proposals and draw out ratios)

- Paper correspondence remains the most recognised tools and the most employed for communicating

- Agents move around the building to contact colleagues

- Tools are not shared on the network (printers, scanners etc…)

- Internet access is not filtered

- The Human Resources application which has been developed does not allow for consolidated treatment of the data it contains, data which has been captured in a disparate manner without codification

- The ministry's action plans and those of the agencies and the districts and their budgets are developed in Word, or in the best cases in Excel but they do not allow for the consolidation of data that is necessary to produce a key performance indicator board to monitor the harmonious and synchronised progress of activities at any level. Data has to be re-entered numerous times (which is a waste of time and a source of errors)

- The MIS tools which are being developed should integrate all of the useful information from the lowest level (village communities) and must be installed in all of the bodies under supervision up to districts so that data can be consolidated into a common tool at MINAGRI. This tool should allow the ministry to have better visibility of the development of its sector and to truly measure the impact of its directives (which can only be evaluated in the field)

- A project management tool is also missing as it would allow the ministry to have a tool for steering the activities for which it is responsible

The reliability of document storage and archives is insufficient and should be reinforced so that agents can use library to store their files and to search for other pieces of work or documents.

Documents received by agents (paper or soft) are not shared. They are filed according to the individual (paper documents by chronological order and in personal files on computers). Multiple versions are kept making the search for final versions complicated.

The security of the ministry's documents and its agencies is not assured (there are not the means for filing in the offices) and computer data is protected by agents' individual passwords and the fact that they turn off their computers when they leave the office. There is no organised back of documents and the virus scanning is not systematic (agents wait for the ICT person to do it).

The tool that MINAGRI is in the process of installing is marked by a lack of consultation with the national institutions created to support the state services, such as RITA and NISR. Finally the ministry is not drawing enough benefit from the applications used in the projects and programmes financed by the donors. Agents do not understand the full potential of these applications. And yet, some of them could usefully be put in place in the ministry or in agencies, maybe even in the districts to improve the efficiency with which information is dealt with and the vertical and transversal movement of information through the network which covers the agricultural sector.

4.6.2   Management system (including procedures)

The management system of MINAGRI essentially consists of tools, represented by management software packages and procedures.

A/The management of finances at MINAGRI

The main tools in use come from MINECOFIN. These are public finance management software packages: accounting, stock and purchasing management, petty cash etc…

The procedure for allocating budgets stipulates a monthly payment, which reduces the flexibility and the latitude of those in charge to carry out their activities and to pay their suppliers. Since 2008 budget transfers are quarterly which improves the quality of management planning and the quality of the relationship with suppliers.

B/ Human resource management system

MINAGRI uses the 'tools' provided by MIFOTRA. These include the Statute of the Public Service, circulars, administrative orders and other supports such as the cadres organiques, the pay system

etc… All of these supports currently need to be revised in order to meet the needs of a job-based public service.

The new statute of civil servants which is currently being examined by the parliament and the manual of human resource procedures which is with the CIC (Interministerial Coordination Committee) should meet the needs of the new direction.

While waiting for the human resource management software to be made available by MIFOTRA to all state institutions, MINAGRI has acquired a computer application to manage its own human resources.

MINAGRI also has the results of a census of the human resources in the agriculture sector which was carried out in 2005/2006 by an external consultant, but which has not been captured in a database.

C/ Procedures and supports for work

MINAGRI does not have any specific procedures. This 'tool' is perceived as applicable only to legal administrative orders. The management procedures most often used are those of MINECOFIN (budget, finances, tender process, petty cash, and procurement) and the human resource tools developed by MIFOTRA. They are often:

- Cumbersome because they have inherited the habits of the old Administration (e.g. 'ordre de mission' (permission for civil servants to travel)

- Contrary to the new logic of giving staff responsibilities (too concentrated on the decision-makers at the highest level)

- Developed by other institutions without consultation with those people who have to use them

Critical analysis of MINAGRI's management system

The human resource application at MINAGRI is not really operational. The database is insufficient and its contents must be reviewed together with rules on entering and use of data. It is not available on the network with the agencies, projects and even less so with the districts (and yet the competences of the decentralised staff are important to know in order to build the sector capacity building national policy).

The public service human resource management tools are not adapted or obsolete for a job-based public service which has to plan and anticipate. The current situation shows that:
- the description of posts in the Cadre Organique are not adapted, in some cases even incoherent or unrealistic

- the system of pay is not adapted to a system based on jobs and performance

- the descriptions of roles do not exist in order to qualify posts and to manage careers

- training plans are not used as planning management tools nor to develop abilities or careers

- the current system of filling posts and recruitment is a handicap to the management of careers (external recruitment is systematic) and does not allow for the selection of staff based on criteria of competence, capacity and experience.

Procedures

- Human resources procedures are obsolete and no human resource management application exists which could be installed on the network of all state institutions. It is necessary to wait for the adoption of the human resource procedures manual which is currently with the CIC before implementing it at all levels.

- No unit fulfils the role of 'organisation and methods' which could be responsible for the ministry's own procedures (e.g. for control, evaluation etc…)

Work supports: several management tasks are still carried out entirely on paper which is copied, signed and stamped. These methods do not meet the demands of modernisation which are sought by state institutions. These working processes are slow, bureaucratic and illustrate that in terms of giving all staff responsibility, only the most basic tasks without any real decision-making are delegated. The protocol of these tasks (in which the format is more important than the content) obscures their banal nature and the lack of genuine delegation of power and even less of decision-making.

4.6.3 Functional relationships (in particular with bodies under the supervision of the ministry)

The various actors of the sector (MINAGRI agents, agencies, projects, districts and sectors) are confined to their area and their place of work. Communication remains difficult and synergies are almost impossible (all the more so with structures outside of the sector). The exchange of information remains laborious in particular with the districts cf. annex 11 – functional relationships.

The agriculture sector is dependent on other key sectors such as infrastructure, water and sewerage, environment, land usage and the private sector for development and decentralisation. Only close collaboration between the various parties (of ministries and their agencies) can allow for useful synergies thanks to communication and the coordination of efforts.

The current interpretation of decentralisation does not allow for **technical** steering of the Agricultural Reform. However, this is the prerogative and role of MINAGRI and its executive bodies (agencies, institutes, offices and projects).

> **Critical analysis of functional relationships**
>
> **The lack of information at a decentralised level** on national agricultural strategies and on the logical framework linked to the EDPRS is a factor which is penalising all of the actors of the sector and for MINAGRI in particular, which has to report to the government on the state of progress of the agricultural reform.
>
> **The compartmentalisation of services** does a disservice to national objectives. The lack of consultation with external partners can result in conflicts in the priorities of each institution[23] and a lack of visibility in the running of operations and in their prioritisation at local and national level. Finally, it impedes the correct identification of planned indicators to measure the impact in the field of government action.
>
> **The problem of understanding of decentralisation** which links the districts to MINALOC is a burning issue. MINALOC intervenes in all things **administrative, but in terms of directives and technical controls**, it lacks the means. In addition, this interpretation excludes the role of technical advisor which MINAGRI and its agencies should be playing, at the very least.
>
> This interpretation of the decentralisation penalises not only MINAGRI, but appears to be cutting off technical ministries from their roots.
>
> The lack of a **formal** relationship between MINAGRI's agencies and projects with the districts and sectors down to Umudugudu level **compromises the success of the agricultural reform.**
>
> However, the decentralisation process was designed so that MINAGRI would maintain its overall management of the sector and have the right to inspect the achievements of districts as well as an advisory role towards MINALOC to improve the efficiency of the services working in the sector. This understanding of decentralisation should be shared by district and sector agents responsible for agriculture.

4.6.4   Management (including time management)

The old managerial methods of the public Administration are still prevalent in the state institutions. However, the decision to decentralise and disperse operations at the level of the bodies under supervision of the ministry should be accompanied by a change in the methods used to management. In fact, this political choice focuses on the implementation of a performance system based on giving full responsibilities to agents.

A/ Leadership and Management

Decision-making in all areas still remains essentially with the highest levels of management (Secretary General, Secretary of State, Minister). The procedures and practices in place effectively formalise once again the centralisation of work, the same is true for ongoing management tasks.

Directors have responsibilities that are limited to basic management tasks that have been taken on within specific procedures. Signing correspondence still remains concentrated at very high managerial levels (Secretary General).

The general directors of agencies that have budget autonomy remain dependent on MINAGRI which negotiates their budgets on their behalf with MINECOFIN and their cadre organique with MIFOTRA. They have to wait for the results that these two institutions impose on them.

Generally speaking, the management (of the ministry and agencies under its supervision) lack authority over the agents that work for them, even if they participate to a certain degree in their recruitment.

---

[23] Conflict between their priorities and those of MINAGRI (e.g. infrastructure developments not planned on time, divergence of land usage and the rights of ownership etc…)

The mobility of agents - as practiced at present – is a handicap to the managers in terms of organising work plans for staff but also their own priorities. In fact, mobility is enshrined in the constitutional law which allows for the free circulation of people. This means that it is impossible to guarantee that staff will stay in place for a sufficiently long period to create and lead work teams motivated by common annual objectives.

B/ Time management

Individual paper-based diaries are the most often used by staff to manage their activities:

- The Ministers, Secretaries of State, Secretary General and directors mostly share their diaries with their assistants

- Professionals – if they have one – do not share their diaries either with their colleagues or with the assistant of their unit.

Working meetings in the ministry are occasionally planned (such as the Management Meeting) but they are not always respected and can be sacrificed to unplanned work or emergencies which prevents diaries from being effectively managed cf annex 12 – Time management.

Critical analysis of leadership and time management

Some basic activities are dealt with at the highest level of the Administration to the detriment of policies and strategies. This is poor utilisation of time and equally leads to a slow bureaucracy which prevents flexibility of communication and reactivity of services (everything has to go up to the boss). For example: permission for field trips; the organisation of transversal working relationships; the acquisition of materials etc…

Current procedures ratify this vertical structure of management, reinforce the compartmentalisation and prevent effective collaboration between units, agencies and projects which are dependent on the ministry. This phenomenon is exaggerated when one needs to get in touch with an external body (districts, other support ministry, donor, private partner, NGO etc…).

MIFOTRA has prepared an instruction for Cabinet concerning the delegation of signatures to its different directors. This instruction, if accepted could be taken as an example to be implemented in other ministries.

The weakness of the managerial function and the lack of authority impedes the implementation of a performance system at ALL levels. Managers do not have authority over transfers and the departure of their staff and do not have any means of controlling turnover. In such a situation, it is difficult to implement the performance system which should be introduced this year.

Time management is another major problem. Staff spend time managing urgent matters (normally urgent for someone else, not the person concerned), often to the detriment of their timetable. This results in long working hours for some agents who have too much work and believe it to be impossible to take their holidays while other people do not have enough work to occupy them. Finally, the current system does not allow meetings to be filtered or prioritised.

The planning function believes its obligation is to deal with urgent matters, and yet its role should be to help to limit irrelevant interruptions and disruption. The Planning units in the public institutions are unable to do this, once again because of the lack of decision-making powers.

2nd SECTION - RECOMMENDATIONS

5   INTRODUCTION

A/ Presentation of recommendations

Given the rarity of human resources, both in terms of quality and quantity and given the constraints of needing to stabilise the wage bill, the recommendations are focused on proposals with fast effects and if possible without excessive financial impact. As a result, they focus on improvements to the management system and staff abilities to increase the productivity and efficiency of the institution.

In order to improve the efficiency of MINAGRI's services, some measures can be put into effect IMMEDIATELY following a simple decision by the leadership of the ministry to introduce changes which – without cost – should facilitate the operation of services. Other measures on the other hand should:
- Be negotiated with other partner ministries to assure their collaboration

- Be presented to Cabinet if they are common to all state institutions.

All of the measures presented here concern MINAGRI, but some are equally applicable to other ministries. As a result the activities proposed for their implementation are specified in the final consolidated report. This synthesises the improvements that are common and specific to each ministry which have been proposed following the functional reviews.

B/ Assessment in relation to the functional reviews of 2005/2006

The following aspects still need to be improved:
- Collaboration with decentralised bodies

- Services to the population.

The following aspects are currently being implemented:

- Information system (MIS) and quality and availability of statistical data

- Building synergies with ministries and donors who have an influence on the sector (cf. the Rural Development Cluster, created in 2002 and the planned SWAP which should be implemented in 2008

- Improvement of MINAGRI agents' abilities.

The creation of an inspection function is an idea that was abandoned in favour of strengthening the monitoring and evaluation function within MINAGRI.

C/ Assessment of other areas explored during this mission

- Lack of leadership at MINAGRI and its agencies to guide the sector

- Organisational structure of MINAGRI needs to be reviewed

- Lack of a tool for steering the sector at a central level to monitor the process of implementation of policies, strategies and action plans

- Lack of training in the area of expertise, contents of trainings should be reviewed to better meet needs

- Lack of a performance management system, both institutional and individual

- Under-utilisation of the modern communication methods available thanks to new technology

- Lack of management procedures that are common to institutions and specific to MINAGRI

- Poor time management

- Lack of efficient document management

On all these aspects, MINAGRI and the agencies under its supervision can make efficiency improvements and financial savings if general organisation is improved.

5.1 General recommendations

The recommendations below concern all of the state institutions. They are intended to IMPROVE the provision of public services overall in order to develop the coordination of activities at a national level and develop the abilities and productivity of staff by:

- Reorganising and modernising information, communication and documentation systems

- Implementation of management procedures that are common to all institutions and codified.

These recommendations apply equally to MINAGRI.

5.1.1 Legal and regulatory framework

The new Statute of the Public Service[24] as well as the human resources procedure manual which support its implementation and which is currently with the CIC should be widely communicated within institutions and explained. This will necessitate the sensitisation of managers and training of human resource managers.

A number of other supports still need to be developed and implemented by MIFOTRA, for example:
- Disciplinary rules

- Procedures for setting performance indicators and objectives

- Nomenclature of roles and database of all posts

- Policies on motivation, career management, skills management etc…

cf. paragraph 515 below which lists all of these supports.

5.1.2 Information system and management

The states institutions should modify their working habits by better using the facilities offered by new technology. This requires the introduction of new methods of working, of communicating, of collaborating and of consulting. The following need to be established or reviewed:
- A system of delegation of power (to relieve the highest decision-making levels of daily management tasks and to give responsibility to unit directors)

- A policy for motivating civil servants which should not be based purely on salaries

- Procedures for working relationships between institutions to improve the flow of information between administrations, the bodies under their supervision, districts and between their agents

- A more dynamic management method within the public Administration to establish clear leadership

5.1.3 Communication system

Communication by institutions needs to be conceived globally so that each type of working interaction can be matched to the best tool (in terms of efficiency and efficacy) and the best procedure. Generally it is necessary to PUT IN PLACE AN E-COMMUNICATION SYSTEM which is built on the following tools (dependent on analysis of the different type of interaction):

---

[24] As soon as it is approved by Cabinet it should be presented to parliament for final adoption.

- **Professional** mobile telephones for urgent communication which demands an immediate response. The control of the use of mobile phones and the implementation of a managed and secure communication system assumes a reflection and detailed specification

- Dedicated IP telephony to be used for professional purposes only to replace fixed line phones

- Professional instant messaging services such as Microsoft Exchange to allow the management of communication on a messaging network for each ministry (or for the Administration as a whole)

- Systematic use of email for all transmission of written messages. Rules governing the usage of emails should be codified:

  - Style of the contents of messages depending on the recipient (using Word models)

  - Method of signature

  - Transmission of attachments (reduction of volume, type of file PDF, Word etc...)

- The transmission of traditional correspondence - the procedure for which is much longer and complex – by electronic mail as an attachment wherever possible.

5.1.4   Working processes and key procedures

The aim is to achieve an Administration in which electronic documents are given priority over paper documents and AN E-ADMINISTRATION MUST BE PUT IN PLACE.

A/ Working processes and tools

An improved use of ICT tools for processing information must take place together with an improvement in productivity and the efficacy of services. Computer users must be trained in all aspects of the use of their tools:

- Advanced treatment of texts and the use of OLE functions

- Systematic saving (backup) of data and protection of documents

- Transfers to other users via the network

- Revisions

- Instant messaging between users

- Use of Outlook calendars and techniques for sharing diaries

- Group mail etc…

Equally, the managerial staff must be trained in management techniques and in particular:
- Time management

- Organisation of work

- Running a meeting

- Evaluation methods

- Team leadership etc…

B/ Procedures

The procedures of an institution are a guarantee of security, safety and the quality of various tasks which operate alongside the activities to achieve the objectives of the Administration. It is essential that the rules and procedures should be designed according to the rules and principles of the organisation. They should be codified in a specific document so that they can be communicated, updated and perpetuated.

Currently the Rwandan Administration only has procedures related to the preparation and spending of the budget, which are codified or in the course of being codified, and Management procedures for the staff of the central Administration, which are being validated with the CIC.

All other management procedures still need to be examined, developed and codified:

- Procedures for the management of correspondence need to be modernised to:
    - Put in place a computerised tool for internal monitoring of correspondence (which can be consulted by all concerned)
    - Develop transfers of digital documents instead of paper documents
    - Install a system for electronic signatures for the managerial staff of the ministry etc…
- Administrative procedures
- Document management procedures
- Procedures for the development of strategic and action plans
- Procedures for coordinating with districts
- Procedures applicable to all these elements at district level
- User guides etc…

Each procedure has to be the subject of an exhaustive analysis to:

- Identify the documents and basic information validating the necessity of a procedure
- Determining the expected product of the process and its intended beneficiary
- Identify the succession of tasks which run alongside the implementation of the procedure
- Identify the movement of information relating to the procedure and those posts which are concerned by each of the tasks
- Put in place controls

Once the analysis is complete, a structure for the use and movement of useful information is developed and the procedures manual is written.

Following validation by the appropriate authorities, procedure manuals are officially published within the context of regulation and they are disseminated to be put into practice.

Users have to be trained so that they can conform to the procedures and respect them and so that they can master the use of any computerised supports that result.

The problem of procedures is crucial if a new Administration is to be put in place. In such an Administration common activities have to be carried out according to the same principles in all institutions. However, each institution has to have its own procedures in order to ensure its service provision is stable and of consistent quality. These procedures also have the aim of facilitating the training, monitoring and control of work carried out by agents.

5.1.5　Management of the state's human resources

The Administration has an urgent need for tools which will allow institutions to:

- Control the matching of human resource needs with available staff or those due to be recruited

- Motivate staff in order to manage them according to needs and to ensure the productivity of good quality personnel

- Plan for demographic evolution of staff and needs in terms of quantity and quality in order to maintain the best possible match between the two

- Monitor the stability of the Public Administration and its independence vis-à-vis policy

To achieve this, it is indispensable to quickly complete the Public Service Reform already underway. In particular, MIFOTRA needs the following supports and tools:

- The Statute of the Public Service currently being adopted by parliament and which:
  - Specifies the rights and duties of the civil servant and conditions his or her independence vis-à-vis policy
  - Confirms the transformation to a job-based public service in which posts are qualified by the role and the conditions of exercise
  - Determines the rules of career management which allow movement through the hierarchy of roles dependent on experience, abilities, capacity and performance.
- National policy on the management of state agents which specifies the principles to be respected on: recruitment; career development; training; salaries etc…
- The related management tools are:
  - Nomenclature of roles (qualified by their characteristics in terms of capacity and necessary experience and categorised in relation to other roles)
  - Directory of posts and roles
  - System for evaluating individual performance (currently being reviewed by the Cabinet for validation and should be implemented this year)
  - Single database with all state employees
  - Human resource procedures that are secure (currently being reviewed by CIC)
  - ICT network which serves managers and decision-makers
- A system of remuneration of posts based on the role, experience acquired and individual performance.

Finally, MIFOTRA should revise its official arrangements for:
- The reintroduction of professional experience for certain roles

- The regulation of the free movement of agents in the institutions, giving priority to internal recruitment and circumscribing the conditions of access to external competition.

Annex 13 presents the diagram of all the tools necessary for the implementation of a dynamic human resource management system for civil servants.

5.2 Recommendations specific to MINAGRI

The recommendations below will not be definitively validated by MINAGRI until an exhaustive functional review of the whole agriculture sector has been carried out.

This sector audit should cover bodies under its supervision, projects, districts and sectors operating in the agricultural area. This condition set out by MINAGRI is essential for the recommendations below to be accepted by the leadership of the ministry.

5.2.1 Organisation and distribution of missions, responsibilities and tasks

The organisational structure of the ministry should be reviewed and the distribution of missions clarified.

A/ MINAGRI's mandate

MINAGRI's mandate is well defined in texts but it needs to be better publicised and understood. Texts exist which define its role, that of the bodies under its supervision AND that of the partners and districts as executive arms.

Nonetheless, following decentralisation these texts remain little known. The functional links between MINAGRI and the other ministries and other national and international institutions which consolidate government action seem already to be well established at authority level, but they need to be refined and clarified professionals simply need to be reminded of them both in the ministry, agencies and districts.

It is suggested that a joint information campaign (MINAGRI/MINALOC) should be organised or that a common text should be distributed to remind people of the respective roles so that each level knows the latitude of its actions and its contribution in relation to the others and that these texts are in force.

B/ Organisation of MINAGRI

The organisational audit shows that all changes in the cadre organique should be preceded by a functional review. Such an approach clarifies very effectively the areas of the organisation which need to be reinforced or re-structured.

MINAGRI's structure should bring out more clearly the areas of activity so that its main mission is evident and so that identifying who does what it easier. The proposed organogram on the following page is provided as a suggestion. It aims to:

- Position all support services within the Finance and Internal Resources Unit (ICT is in this unit)
- Strengthen the monitoring and evaluation function for action plans and projects. The proposal for an inspection function as proposed by the previous functional reviews has been abandoned. Professionals from the Planning Unit have to take on this activity as part of their responsibilities.
- Strengthen the Sector Capacity Building function within the Planning Unit
- Strengthen the technical dimension of the ministry by creating a specific unit responsible for sector policy
- Retain within the General Secretariat operational projects which cover all areas of agriculture (plus projects currently at the end of their cycle)

-   Locate specialised projects within the concerned agencies. This option will automatically generate savings because it will allow the project to make use of the Internal Resources unit and to capitalise on the know-how (which will benefit all staff, not just project staff), something that is difficult to measure in financial terms. The only projects that should remain at ministry level are projects covering all of the sub-sectors of agriculture such as PSTA, RSSP etc…

-   Create a one-stop-centre at ministry level to respond to requests from other state institutions.

Suggested Organogram for MINAGRI

Ministre de l'Agriculture et des Ressources Animales
- Secrétaire Particulier
- Assistant Administratif

Secrétaire d'Etat chargé de l'Agriculture
- Secrétaire Particulier
- Assistant Administratif

Secrétaire Général

Relations Publiques et Communication

Affaires Juridiques

Unité Finances et Gestion des Ressources Internes
- Gestion et Développement des RH
- Gestion des Crédits
- Comptablité
- Approvisionnement
- Suivi des Systèmes ICT
- Secrétariat Central
- Documentation

Unité Planification et Renforcement des Capacités
- Planification
- Suivi/Evaluation
- Développement des Capacités
- Statistiques

Unité Politique Agricole et Vulgarisation
- Secrétaire
- Politique Agricole
- Politique Conservation des sols
- Cartographe
- Politique de Production et Santé
- Politique de Pisciculture et Pêche

Projets communs (à toutes les entités sous tutelle)
- RSSP Appui au Secteur Rural
- PSTA Appui à la Transformation du Secteur Agricole
- Schéma Directeur de l'Irrigation
- Irrigation et Développement des Collines
- PASNV Appui au Système National de Vulgarisation
- Projet prioritaire d'Intensification des Cultures
- PDERB Dévlpt de l'Economie Rurale de Bugesera
- PADAB Appui au Dévlpt Agricole de Bugesera

Guichet Unique

Sous Tutelle

4 agences

RHODA	Sériculture	PDCRE Développement des Cultures de Rente et d'Exportation	
RADA	Storage for Pest Management	Banana Production	Commodity Chain	AFSR Appui au Secteur Semencier du Rwanda
RARDA	One Cow per Family	Honey Promotion	Laboratoire Vétérinaire	PADBEL Développement du Secteur laitier	PAIGELAC Aménagement et Gestion des lacs intérieurs
ISAR	Réhabilitation du Laboratoire in Vitro	Capacity building for senior Scientists	

2 offices
- OCIR - Thé
- OCIR - Café

Some functions would benefit from being lightened by systematically using national organisations which have been created to serve the state's institutions, such as RITA for ICT, REMA for the environment, RBS for standards and norms and the NISR for national statistics.

N.B.: The proposal to create one-stop-centres within each body under the supervision of the ministry and districts can be retained following the sector functional review which has been requested. These one-stop-centres will serve mainly to respond to requests from the public and to direct people to services or people on an ad hoc basis.

C/ Districts organisation

The organisation of districts needs to be reviewed so that national policies and strategies for agriculture resulting from the EDPRS can be fully implemented in the field. This requires services in close proximity capable of supporting farmers so that they can learn to modernise their agricultural techniques, so that they are encouraged to set up cooperatives, so that they improve their productivity and increase their revenues. Decentralised staff are not currently in a position to effectively carry out all of these activities.

MINAGRI is currently negotiating with MIFOTRA and MINECOFIN to strengthen decentralised staff capacity, including:

- At district level: the creation of an Agriculture and Livestock Farming Unit with two professionals specialised in each area

- At sector level: the creation of a post "Head of Livestock Farming[25]", because one single agronomist is not sufficient. It is necessary to recruit A2 level vets who are better placed to respond to the queries of livestock farmers and to report back to local authorities on the specific difficulties of each region.

  In addition health monitoring of herds needs to be carried out in the field by specialists capable of identifying symptoms observed and to feed this information back to the authorities and veterinary surgeon of the district. In cases where A2 veterinary technicians are no longer available (because they are working on a freelance basis as inseminators), the authorities should be negotiate service contracts with them so that they can carry out this monitoring function.

D/ Distribution of tasks

The distribution of tasks needs to be revised to correspond to the suggested organogram presented above. In addition the contents of cadres organiques need to be reviewed so that they genuinely express the expectations and profiles required to carry out the tasks of each post.

5.2.2 Development and monitoring and evaluation of strategic plans and action plans

A/ Development of strategic plans and action plans

The development of sector strategies at MINAGRI is carried out in a participatory way with all actors from the agriculture sector.

The programme approach which was adopted should be maintained for the next strategic plan which will follow on from the plan which finishes at the end of this year.

The process for developing strategic plans and action plans needs, on the other hand, to be revisited and standardised across all institutions so that it is done in the same way. This system needs to be designed so that each institution has a proper tool for planning indicating: conditions needed to achieve objectives; deadlines to be respected; methods of revision etc… so that strategic plans can be carried over if deadlines are not met and so that they are clearly linked to the results and achievements of annual action plans.

This tool should ensure that plans are renewed at least two years in advance. This approach will allow MINAGRI to have its new strategic plan available within the appropriate timeframe to avoid having transition years in which action plans consist only of actions from previous plans that have not been completed.

---

[25] This option has been accepted and will be implemented from 1st June 2008.

In the meantime it would be useful for the synthesis of the new strategic plan to at least be captured in **Excel or Access**. This will facilitate its translation into annual action plans that MINAGRI will have to produce on this basis up until 2012. This will reduce time spent re-entering information and the risk of mistakes by allowing information from the strategic plan (programmes planned, sourced of finance, provisional deadlines, partners involved etc…) to be moved directly into more appropriate software for project management.

The annual action plans at MINAGRI should also be developed in an application which can easily reproduce the elements of the strategic plan and EDPRS cf. annex 14 – Preparation of action plans. It could also therefore be easily consolidated and distributed among agencies and institutions responsible for its implementation.

This computer application (such as Excel initially) should allow the institution to adopt a more participative approach for developing the ministry annual action plans with the bodies under its supervision because their own action plan results from it and can more easily:

- take into account district plans

- present the programmes planned for the year by breaking down all of the actions into sub-activities that are also detailed and chronological so that:

  ▪ action plans are consistent

  ▪ control points are fixed (providing indicators which validate the logical implementation of the plan)

- ensure coherence between the needs expressed and the budget

The annual action plan will therefore be much more concrete and can be budgeted on a justified basis and will bring out the priorities for each programme and each region.

B/ Coherence of action plans of agencies under the supervision of the districts

Thanks to the use of a computer application which is more adapted to the monitoring of activities:
- bodies under the supervision of the ministry will be able to easily finalise their own annual action plans

- MINAGRI will easily – without interfering in the work of MINALOC – exercise their right to review the district action plans (via its agencies) in order to :

  ▪ monitor the consistency of actions at all concerned levels

  ▪ ensure that various actors take ownership of action plans (agencies, projects, institutions, offices and districts which should know the action plans of others) so that they are the basis of performance contracts.

  ▪ facilitate sharing of information between actors to create a "culture" specific to the agriculture sector.

In the meantime MINAGRI should agree with MINALOC the methods and means for facilitating collaboration between the MINAGRI professionals, agencies, offices, institutions and projects and those of the districts. The aim is to:

- facilitate cooperation and communication with districts

- improve district action plans so that there is more consistency between achievements in the field and the national sector objectives as well as improving agency action plans, institutions, office and therefore the national ministry plan

- install a computer application in each body under the ministry's supervision including districts and train concerned agents to facilitate the consolidation of information

- review the role of Rural Development Clusters so that they play the role that was intended when they were created.

C/ Coherence with other influential ministries and donors

- Initiate a multi-sector cluster for annual action plans in order to coordinate the prioritisation of activities of other ministries and projects financed by donors

- Put in place SWAPS as recommended in March 2007 by the EDPRS and define their role with regard to coordination of achievement of national objectives.

This consultative approach at local and national level can generate economies of scale at the level of the National Budget.

D/ Monitoring and evaluation of strategic plans and action plans

The report template which has been developed in Word and has just been disseminated to districts for the monitoring and evaluation of the impact of annual action plans should be reviewed so that it better links to annual action plans and so that it is at least developed in Excel or Access.

In the medium term, MINAGRI should acquire a **project management application** to facilitate the development and monitoring of the implementation of action plans and their budgets, in particular to:

- Prioritise programmes (on the basis of priority objectives) as well as the activities that result

- Break down programmes and their activities into detailed sub-activities

- Establish a realistic annual calendar of the running of the action plan and detailing the logical order in which to carry out activities

- Indicate critical points, in particular related or previous activities which should be completed to avoid blockages (e.g. have storage depots ready in time to receive the harvest)

- Budget the costs of each activity (identify different sources of financing) ; evaluate the budget to be negotiated with MINECOFIN

- Automatically readjust the action plans according to priorities as a result of budget ceilings issued by MINECOFIN

- Facilitate the distribution of MINAGRI's annual actions plans among bodies under its supervision and the districts according to programmes and activities

- Control the respect of planned deadlines (funds made available at the appropriate time so that activities can be carried out)

- Coordinate activities and tasks that need to take place in order for action plans to be able to be correctly implemented (significant milestones in the chronological flow of activities)

This tool will significantly improve the evaluation of action plans by introducing:

- measures of impact (concrete results recorded)

- intermediary evaluations (during the exercise) to allow for – if necessary – the re-adjustment of action plans and corresponding budgets

- end of year evaluations which should help the rescheduling of activities and put in place action plans that can be carried over.

If implemented at all levels (down to district level) this project management tool should be the subject of training for users. This approach supports capacity building, the transfer of know-how and the creation of a common culture.

5.2.3   Performance contracts

A system for performance evaluation has just been approved by the Cabinet. The related procedure should be formalised and systematised (with a calendar of meetings, quantitative reports and fixed deadlines). The following recommendations should be taken into account.

A/ Institutional performance contracts should be put in place this year.

They should specify the objectives and the resources provided to achieve the expected results. Indicators should be easily identifiable and measurable (on the basis of fixed objectives) but above all should be based on the real impact obtained in the field. Performance contracts for units and bodies under the supervision of the ministry must:

- Refer to the results expected from action plans and mission letters

- Address all levels concerned (Minister, Directors, Mayors etc…)

Performance contracts that already exist at district level (Imihigo) need to be improved to take into account the objectives indicated in national plans and their impact (results achieved) in the field. Mayors could also benefit from a change to their performance obligations to take into account results obtained in their district. For example for the implementation of agricultural reform within the context of EDPRS: support the coordination of agency action plans; measure the impact of achievements; savings made (in time, energy, money etc…).

Such a system implies that MINAGRI should have the right to review the technical evaluation of results.

B/ Individual performance contracts should also be put in place for all state employees. They should include objectives negotiated at the start of the year between each agent and his or her superior. These contracts should be based on measurable and realistic indicators and should be accompanied by the means to achieve them (training, equipment etc...). To be viable this system requires:

- that staff stay in their post for the duration of their performance contract (at least one year)

- the creation of a fund either based on savings made through the improved use of new technology as proposed in this report, either through the progressive reintroduction into salaries of experience validated by results obtained, or indeed both.

C/ Technical Assistance contracts should stipulate an obligation on experts to transmit their know-how (cf SWAP?). The obligation of the Rwandan party would be to provide the means and/or put agents in a position to achieve the objectives agree and at the very least, to ensure that trained agents stay in their posts.

5.2.4 Leadership and management

Leadership and management have to play an important role with regard to motivation of staff and the achievement of objectives. To succeed in this, the current method of management needs to be reviewed. Managerial staff, both at ministry level and within bodies under the supervision of the ministry, should be given greater authority.

In addition, the success of the performance system requires the following:

- **Managerial staff should have effective authority over their staff**. They should have the necessary power to set annual objectives, give staff the means to achieve them and as a result be able to demand from staff a level of quality and productivity in their work. Managerial staff cannot themselves have objectives to achieve if they do not have the necessary resources – in particular human – to succeed.

- **The managerial staff at MINAGRI and the bodies under their supervision should exercise greater technical authority over agents in charge of the agriculture sector in the districts.** They should be able to intervene directly to facilitate the work of their own agents with those of the district and have the right to review planned activities undertaken by the latter as well as to review the quality of the work undertaken in the field.

- Delegation of management responsibilities should be the subject of a global study before any decision is made to identify the responsibilities which can be delegated and to which post as

well as the type of delegation (permanent or temporary). This should be confirmed in a text signed by the minister and distributed within the ministry and bodies under its supervision.

- **The free movement of state employees** should be changed or explained. Improved stability of staff would allow units to tackle their objectives with the necessary human resources, who are themselves committed to the achievement of results.

  Currently mobility of staff is assimilated in the free circulation of people as stated in the Constitution. There is no question of challenging this, because any agent is free to leave the Administration. However, the Statute of Public Service which governs civil servants incorporates modalities on transfers. These modalities should form part of a procedure which prioritises internal recruitment on criteria linked to the profiles of the jobs for which there are vacancies. This approach will be a factor of motivation because the agent will find it beneficial to continue working for the same institution.

This option of internal recruitment supports the management of careers and therefore provides motivation and generates loyalty. It would be useful to calculate **the cost of staff turnover** within the Administration. The human and financial cost would enable the real loss to be measured. At MINAGRI this situation penalises progress and significantly compromises the institution's ability to achieve its objectives.

To recognise individual merit, it is suggested that a fund is created[26] which will allow the agents that deserve it to be rewarded. The provision of such a reward depends on an annual evaluation that the supervisor should participate in, an activity which should contribute to establishing the authority of immediate superiors.

5.2.5   MINAGRI's operations

The prevalence of old working methods should be reduced to allow for the implementation of new working methods and tools. MINAGRI should benefit from the acquisition of the new server which is planned for this summer in order to implement the recommendations set out in this report.

A/ Information and document management

The modernisation of the information system at MINAGRI is well underway. Proposals have been made to increase the efficiency of units by providing them with new computer applications (cf paragraph 526 – resources).

The new Management Information System (MIS) needs to be developed so that the statistics already capture in the ministry's Excel database can be easily integrated. It should also be developed to allow for the further improvement of the data (with the data from NISR for example). Attention should be paid to the compatibility of the applications so that the transfer of data is easy and reliable.

For all of these applications, MINAGRI should plan to train users (including agencies, ISAR, offices, even districts) to improve the steering of the agricultural reform at all levels.

Document management at the ministry should be improved to fully meet the needs of users and it should be managed electronically. MINAGRI has anticipated this need and is in the process of installing a software package to be tested. Nonetheless, this option does not include development of the ministry library and archives.

The ministry's documents are created in an electronic format by agents on their computers. The most obvious solution for better management is to put in place a document management system on the central server that is accessible via the network and on which all documents are systematically and automatically saved. The organisation of this stock should meet the documentary norms currently in force.

---

[26] Generated through economies of scale which the suggested changes should bring about

As a result, each document will be stored with: the name of the author, the subject, the date of creation and possibly key words which described its contents (to ease research). Reports should be accompanied by a short summary.

As a result, MINAGRI has two options:
- The software package currently being installed can satisfy the need to make better use of all of the documents currently produced by the ministry =>it should be installed in all ministry computers so that all agents can use it.

- The software package only affects the Document service and Archives => a better adapted tool should be found. On the market, there are software packages that allow document database to be properly exploited and in which cataloguing and filing are carried out on the network. They also allow the library and archives to be fully automated, which also facilitates the search for documents.

In both cases:
- The rules of filing and access to the document database need to be described in a specification document which will take into account the needs of the ministry
- A specific procedures manual for document management should be produced.

Improvement of the information system should also help users searching for information. In addition to this automated system, MINAGRI plans to implement a **one-stop-centre** which will inform and direct the public on services and/or agents who can respond to their requests. The idea of a one-stop-centre should also be studied in more detail during the sector audit to validate or otherwise their implementation in the bodies under the ministry's supervision and in districts.

B/ Working processes and procedures

All working processes will be impacted by the following proposals which aim to:
- Modernise all of the working supports (computers, communication)

- Delegate and give responsibility to directors

- De-compartmentalise services

- Implement a Job-based Public Service and a system of performance based on results and the recognition of individual merit.

Most of these proposals should be accompanied by procedures. Some are common to all institutions; others are linked to MINAGRI's specific area of intervention and to its activities.

As a result, MINAGRI needs to develop and put in place its own procedures, e.g.: Development and monitoring of the implementation and results of annual action plans. Such procedures should indicate the major control points and the appropriate time for the launch of specific activities (for example identifying when the revision of the strategic plan needs to begin).

It is necessary for various unit managers to identify – within the context of the new managerial tasks which will be delegated to them – which activities need to be accompanied by specific procedures. The ministry needs to decide whether it needs external help or whether this function can be carried out by one of its units.

C/ Functional relationships

MINAGRI's working relationships with the bodies under its supervision and other partners should be improved to facilitate consistency between activities in the agriculture sector.

Working relationships between MINAGRI agents and the bodies under its supervision

Reversing the compartmentalisation depends on a simple **ministerial instruction** which would allow direct contact (including meetings) between the professionals of the ministry and those of the bodies under its supervision.

The Management Meeting also needs to be more focused to serve as a vehicle for the exchange of ideas, updates on activities, re-directing activities and identifying synergies. One of these meetings each month should be dedicated to consolidating activities and identifying areas for saving money.

Working relationships with the districts

It is obvious that MINAGRI and its agencies need to work in close collaboration with the districts. Proposals made concerning improved use of technology, the implementation of common procedures and shared computer applications should contribute to the establishment of this essential collaboration. Nonetheless it is proposed that the ministry should work with MINALOC to **organise an information campaign and distribute a common text** which sets out for each party their mutual obligations to:

- Exchange information

- Develop coherent action plans

- Evaluate and consolidate the results obtained in the field with regard to the increase in agricultural production and livestock farming and job creation.

Working relationships with other partners

The development clusters and SWAPS that are due to be implemented in 2008 should be reviewed and/or designed to better establish the position of MINAGRI vi-à-vis its partners and in particular to:

- identify operations which contribute to the success of the Agricultural Reform

- find contributions and/or synergies to be developed with RITA, REMA, NISR, RBS etc…

- exercise its role (via the bodies under its supervision) of 'technical advisor' by providing support during the development of district action plans

- have the right to review (via the bodies under its supervision) to monitor and evaluate the activities carried out in the field because they are achievements which have an impact on the results and justify the activities of MINAGRI.

D/ Time management

Time management is an absolute necessity to improve productivity. The diagnosis shows that managerial staff are often too thinly spread, managing other people's urgent problems. The problems which are put to them often come from sources outside of the institution, over which they have no control and which they deal with to the detriment of their own work priorities.

As a result, correct time management requires the implementation of rigorous procedures and tools designed for each work situation. It is suggested that MINAGRI introduce:

- A new system for time management with:

  - Common agreement to plan meetings and to set out the principles to be respected (be punctual, turn off mobile phones)
  - Use of electronic diaries as much for the management of contacts as for management of calendars
  - The responsibility for organising meetings should fall to the secretariat (to facilitate filtering – establishing priorities on the basis of activities and to avoid as much as possible to have to deal with problems that are not related to the mission or activities of the ministry).

5.2.6   MINAGRI's resources

The equipment and logistics of the ministry are sufficient for the current size of the staff. Nonetheless the use of these resources would benefit from being optimised.

A/ MINAGRI's financial resources

The ministry's finances are limited as a result of the budget ceilings set out by MINECOFIN. Nonetheless, MINAGRI should be in a better position to negotiate with MINECOFIN if its needs were backed up by solid arguments. In order to do this, its action plan should be cantered around results which are linked not only to its objectives but also to the benefits obtained in the field.

Equally, savings could be generated by:
- the systematic use of modern tools and new technology (lower spending on paper, telephone bills etc…)

- the adoption of new working methods

- the systematic search for sources of optimisation of costs and economies of scale through a better use of funds allocated to the bodies under the ministry's supervision for similar activities.

In particular, savings could be found easily through:
- Mutualisation of training. Organising specialised trainings between agencies, including districts should reduce the costs. This would require the person responsible for capacity building at MINAGRI to consolidate training needs at all levels using information gathered by agencies or directly with districts

- Optimisation of the costs of field visits. The exchange of information on field visits could allow professionals from the ministry and various agencies to carry out joint field visits to districts.

- The use of electronic supports that are compatible such as IP telephony, could reduce telephone and post bills and be a complementary method of reducing costs

These savings could be invested in the reward fund which has been proposed to remunerate individual merit introduced through performance contracts.

B/ MINAGRI's computer equipment

- Management Information System (MIS)

  MINAGRI is in the process of acquiring an MIS system which will provide it with a tool that will produce basic information that is useful to its activities. In this way the ministry will be able to measure the impact of its action plans on the major objectives it has to achieve by 2020. The 3 main indicators that the MIS should be able to monitor are:

  - The development of national production towards food self-sufficiency
  - The development of revenues in rural areas
  - The % of farmers and livestock farmers who have changed to other activities (including agro-business) to achieve 50% of the population dependent on agriculture by 2020.

- Project management software

  In the medium term, MINAGRI needs to equip itself with this type of software (which exists on the market) to develop its annual action plans. Such a computer application will allow a noticeable improvement in monitoring and evaluation of these plans and of their impact thanks to the fact that this type of tool allows key performance indicators to be produced quickly and easily, as well as ratios and trends.

- Census of applications used in projects and the bodies under its supervision

  This activity should inform MINAGRI of the resources that are already available to it so that working methods and tools can be improved in both the ministry itself and the bodies under its supervision. The use of each application needs to be investigated as well as their compatibility with each other so that the best applications can be installed in any institution in which they could be useful. This capitalisation would reduce the costs of technical assistance.

- Human resources database at MINAGRI

Whilst waiting for the MIFOTRA database this tool should be modified to allow for better use of the information it contains in order to improve administrative management of staff but also to monitor the capacity building of agents[27]. Significant work on identifying rules needs to be completed so that all data is captured using the same methodology.

<u>The security and safety of systems and computer applications</u>
All information systems that are supported by computers in a network become vulnerable if they are not protected by a security system designed to support a specific policy. The security and safety of ICT systems include two complementary components:

- Security and safety[28] of materials and network

- Security and safety of data.

Given that MINAGRI plans to set up an Intranet before the end of the year, the following security system could be envisaged:

- Control of network access, servers access and individual computer access

- Control of access to the document database

- Control of access to various functions of applications

- Definition of administrative responsibilities for the network and users

- Automatic filter on internet access by type of website and by the priority of the person[29]

- Implementation of an automatic system for saving data

C/ Human resources

The proposals below are made with the caveat that the results of the institutional sector review that has been requested need to be taken into account.

Ministry staff are not complete in terms of the Cadre Organique. To attempt to reduce the current high turnover, MINAGRI could do the following whilst waiting for the MIFOTRA tools:
- Define the posts in its Cadre Organique based on relevant criteria: type of activities, skills and capabilities, experience required

- Carry out recruitment for the posts currently vacant based on competence criteria and verify the quality of tests which are set to assess the capacity demanded

- Establish an internal training policy to meet current needs and to anticipate the future, in particular in terms of a Job-based Public Service which is directed towards career progression, individual merit, the development of know-how etc…

- Improve the human resource management system which has be implemented whilst waiting for the MIFOTRA system to be designed and implemented

- Monitor the promulgation of new texts (Statue and Human Resource procedures for civil servants ; the delegation instructions being produced by MIFOTRA[30]) and implement them within the ministry and bodies under the ministry's supervision

Training (which allows agents to adapt to the changes undergone by the institution) contributes to overall performance of an institution. As a result, MINAGRI specialists and those of the bodies under its supervision should have the right to review the contents of technical training programmes that are delivered to ensure their consistency. The quality of training provided should be evaluated

---

[27] The 2005/2006 census can serve as an initial basis for this work.

[28] The concept of security covers the means put in place to ensure physical protection (fire, destruction, security of the office, safe, external hard drive for backups etc…), the concept of safety covers the means of protecting and controlling access to data (filters, passwords, encrypting etc…)

[29] To limit the abuse of the connection by accessing non-work-related websites during working hours

[30] This aims to lighten the workload at the higher levels and to reduce cumbersome processes for basic tasks

once the beneficiaries are back in their jobs because the validity of training can only be assessed once the newly acquired information is actually being used.

New ICT applications (MIS; Project Management; Human Resources; Document Management) as well as the new communications system (Messenger, Skype) etc… will require a significant investment in training. It will be necessary to plan and budget for the training plan both within MINAGRI and the bodies under its supervision as well as even the districts (for agents working in agriculture).

As a result, it is important to try and retain trained agents to get a better return on the costs of their training. The current system allows for the signature of a beneficiary to agree that he or she will remain in his or her post following training[31]. If he or she leaves, the beneficiary must refund the cost of the training and/or pay a penalty which still needs to be defined by MIFOTRA. This arrangement should be rigorously applied.

Finally, the early retirement of senior management staff who so desire, could help by freeing up jobs for younger employees. A sponsorship system could be envisaged to create partnerships made up of an older employee together with a new employee who needs to be trained. This would make full use of the experience of the older employee and would help with capacity building. The older employee could train the younger one part-time and would receive fees based on a part of his or her former salary in exchange for his or her time and the younger employee would receive the balance of the salary for the period of on-the-job-training.

At district and sector level, proposals are being examined to increase the number of staff and to review the recruitment criteria of agents responsible for livestock farming to allow A2 technicians to be used as these could ensure the health monitoring of livestock either by being fully recruited or by signing a service-provision contract. Currently negotiations are underway to recruit the following staff:

- for each district : 1 unit responsible for agriculture (with 1 agent responsible for agriculture and 1 responsible for livestock farming plus 1 agent already in place responsible for Environment and Natural Resources)

- for each sector: 1 agent responsible for agriculture and 1 responsible for livestock farming

- for each cell: 1 agent responsible for agriculture to mobilise the population

---

[31] For trainings that last less than 6 months the text obliges the agent to remain in the institution for at least 1 year and for trainings that last longer than 6 months the obligation is extended to 2 years.

6 STRENGTHS OF THE RWANDAN ADMINISTRATION

Rwanda is a small country in terms of physical size, which in the space of a few years has considerably improved its communications network (both road and telephone), thereby creating fast links between almost all areas of the country.

Currently, the 30 districts are linked to the internet and can be quickly contacted (the video conferencing system that MINAGRI plans to acquire also meets this objective).

The human size of institutions and the quota of civil servants in each sector of activities should allow for considerable and fast improvement of the management of each sector and make them more dynamic and rewarding (the agriculture sector with 1750 agents has the same number of staff as an SME).

The willingness to develop and build this country is largely shared by the population and civil servants. This is an efficient motor of development.

The creativity of the Rwandan Adminstration has been able to mix modernity and tradition to change its systems and achieve efficiency. Proof of this comes in the form of success stories such as Umuganda, Umudugudu, Imihigo, Gacaca etc…

As a result, the required change in working habits and behaviours that the proposals presented here require should not be seen as a brake. No one doubts that paths will be found to implement the recommendations, and in particular those which will have no influence on the budget and will require simply a decision to be made. The Administration has proved that it is capable of finding the methods and means to mobilise energy and talent and to carry out the necessary changes that are required for modernisation.